CRITERIA FOR SELECTING
BEGINNING BAND METHODS

A SEMINAR PAPER
SUBMITTED TO THE GRADUATE SCHOOL
IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE
REQUIREMENTS
for the degree
MASTER OF MUSIC EDUCATION

by
Cal Olson

Stevens Point, Wisconsin
July, 1980
# Table of Contents

## Chapter

I. STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM ........................................... 1

II. SURVEY OF LITERATURE ................................................. 3

III. DESCRIPTION OF CRITERIA FOR SELECTION  
    OF BEGINNING BAND METHOD BOOKS .......................... 8
    A. Printing  
    B. Precise and logical presentation  
        of fundamentals  
    C. Progressive arrangement of teaching  
        material  
    D. Rate of Progression  
    E. Rhythmic approach  
    F. Approach to theory  
    G. Inclusion of exercises  
        for full band  
    H. Ranges of exercises  
    I. Exercises for the accommodation  
        of individual problems  
    J. Fingering Charts  
    K. Glossary of musical terms and signs  
    L. Unique or supplementary material

IV. EXAMINATION OF METHOD BOOKS ................................. 12  
    By use of criteria

V. CONCLUSION ............................................................... 37

BIBLIOGRAPHY .............................................................. 38
CHAPTER I

STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

The purpose of this study is to outline twelve specific criteria to be used in the selection of beginning band method books. Using these criteria, six beginning band methods will be reviewed and compared. The criteria were chosen from the following considerations: (1) classes that the writer has taken, (2) discussions with other band directors concerning elementary method books, (3) the authors ten years of experience working with beginners, (4) articles written on beginning band methods.

With the available material on the market, it is essential that band directors, especially the young and inexperienced, know how to select a beginning band method book.\(^1\) Poor training in beginning groups will return to haunt the more advanced ensembles in later years.\(^2\) For this reason, the teaching responsibilities are greatest at the beginning level of instruction. Some procedures,

---

\(^1\)Clyde Montgomery Jr., "Criteria For Selecting Method Books For Beginners," *The School Musician* 50 (January 1979) : 45

then, must be used to select a method book that will best suit the students involved.

When it becomes necessary to mention musical notation by letter names, the following pitch delineation system will be applied:¹

CHAPTER II

SURVEY OF LITERATURE

Consideration for selecting the correct method book hinges on many factors. The first thoughts should be directed to the economical and cultural structure of the area in which the book will be used, as well as student schedules and the number of pupils involved. Many books progress at a rate highly suited to the junior high mentality, but would confuse a fourth grade student or the culturally deprived.¹ There are many problems associated with teaching in disadvantaged areas where students, for reasons of economics or others, are culturally deprived. Teachers sometimes lose sight of the special needs in these areas.² The instructor, then, must fit the method book to the teaching situation and schedule that will be used.

There are essentially three basic methods of scheduling: (1) heterogeneous groupings, (2) homogeneous groupings, (3) private lessons. The use of methods for heterogeneous classes (or sometimes called full band) will be studied in this paper because this type is the most common in the

¹ James F. Herendeen, "The Recruitment Of Band Students," The School Musician 44 (March 1973) : 52

² The School Music Program: Description and Standards, Paul R. Lehman, chairman (Vienna, Virginia: M.E.N.C. 1974), p.44
There are two advantages to this teaching method:

1. One teacher can instruct a considerable number of students making cost per pupil low. This fact makes the method very popular with school administrators.

2. The students experience the feeling of belonging to the band, which is psychologically productive.

The following disadvantages could arise through this method of teaching:

1. Students may not receive enough individual attention to their unique problems.

2. Outstanding students are often held back. This could cause better students to drop out because they are not being challenged.\(^2\)

It is natural that a heterogeneous method will be more suited to certain instruments. Considering this, a method should be chosen that favors the instruments in the following order: B-flat clarinet, trumpet, low brass, percussion, flute, French horn, double reeds, and saxophone.\(^3\) This is based on the number of students that usually begin on those particular instruments. For example, there are usually more B-flat clarinets and trumpets in a class of beginners and consequently these areas should receive first attention. From this point, further attention should be directed to more specific items.


\(^2\)Ibid. p. 15

\(^3\)Barbara Buehlman, "Selecting An Elementary Band Method Book," *The Instrumentalist* 1 (November 1973) : 48
While the criteria in this study may not cover every aspect in selecting a method book, they do provide a check-list to aid in the search for the method that will meet the required needs. A more detailed description of each criterion will be offered in chapter III. The criteria compiled for selecting a beginning band method are as follows:

1. Printing
2. Precise and logical presentation of fundamentals
3. Progressive arrangement of teaching material
4. Rate of progression
5. Rhythmic approach
6. Approach to theory
7. Inclusion of exercises for full band
8. Ranges of exercises
9. Exercises for the accommodation of individual problems
10. Fingering charts
11. Glossary of musical terms and signs
12. Unique or supplementary material

Even if the method book selected appears to be the

1Ibid. p. 48
2Montgomery, p. 45
3Montgomery, p. 45
5Ibid. p. 6
6Buehlman, p. 48
7Montgomery, p. 45
8Montgomery, p. 45
9Buehlman, p. 48
10Montgomery, p. 45
11Montgomery, p. 45
12Buehlman, p. 48
best possible, the desired results may not occur. The one element, not yet mentioned, that could render any method book useless is the teacher. The director must teach the material presented in the book. So, once the best method has been selected, it serves only as a guide for the student as he begins a new musical experience. Young instrumental students are as much in need of sensitive, critical, and skillful teaching as are older more experienced musicians.¹

After examining many method books, this writer has selected these six as examples of the different techniques that have been employed in the writing of beginning band methods. The methods to be studied are:

1. Belwin Elementary Band Method by Fred Weber, 1945
2. Hal Leonard Elementary Band Method by Harold Rusch, 1961
3. First Division Band Method by Fred Weber, 1962
4. Learning Unlimited by Art Jensen, 1974
5. Sessions in Sound by Barbara Buehlman, 1976

The methods studied vary dramatically and represent an early publication, a very elementary approach, one of the most popular, and more recent publications that employ updated and innovative techniques.

The Belwin Elementary Band Method will serve as an example of an earlier publication. The Hal Leonard Elementary Band Method, while inappropriate for older beginners, is more

suitable with elementary grade students.\textsuperscript{1} The most popular
of the books is the First Division Band Method.

In a 1974 survey of band directors, the First Division
Elementary Band Method was used by 48.3 per cent of those
directors surveyed.\textsuperscript{2} The Learning Unlimited, Sessions in
Sound, and Band Today methods will serve as an illustration
of new techniques of material presentation. It should be
noted that the highly innovative Learning Unlimited book was
used by only 5.1 per cent of the directors surveyed.\textsuperscript{3} This
may, however, be due to the fact that this particular method
was just presented to the public the year this survey was
conducted.

\textsuperscript{1}James F. Herendeen, "Let's Look At Methods," \textit{The School Musician} \textbf{46} (October 1961) : 8

\textsuperscript{2}James F. Herendeen, "Beginning Band Drop-out Survey," \textit{The School Musician} \textbf{46} (October, 1974) : 31

\textsuperscript{3}Ibid. p. 31
CHAPTER III
DESCRIPTION OF CRITERIA
FOR SELECTING BEGINNING
BAND METHODS

PRINTING

The general effect of a book is weakened if it is difficult to read. There are several elements that should be considered: (1) the size of the printing should be large enough for easy reading, (2) there should be a limited amount of printed material on each page, (3) the quality of the paper should not allow the printing to blur. An attempt to find printing mistakes would be wise, although, not often easy to detect until one actually uses the book. It is helpful if important parts are printed in a different shade or color of ink. Other than color, there should be printing techniques that indicate new material.

PRECISE AND LOGICAL
PRESENTATION OF FUNDAMENTALS

Descriptions and pictures of each instrument and the correct posture should be present. The care of each instrument should also be covered. Attention should then

---

1Buehlman, p. 48
be directed to the ways in which new material is presented.

PROGRESSIVE ARRANGEMENT OF TEACHING MATERIAL

"For a band course of study to be effective as a motivation for the student's learning, the specific items of musical study and their order of presentation must be known to each student in the program."¹ All material covered should lead logically to the next lesson.

RATE OF PROGRESSION

Be sure that the exercises are not too difficult at an early stage. "The greatest pedagogical difficulty arises from the compounding of unresolved problems with the introduction of new ones too quickly."² One must be certain that unintroduced material is not written into exercises or songs.

RHYTHMIC APPROACH

Particular attention should be paid to the rhythms and meter signatures. Examine the techniques that are used to introduce and develop various rhythms and note values. There should be sufficient drills to develop the rhythmic patterns that are presented.

¹Gale Sperry, "The Importance of a Band Course of Study," The School Musician 34 (September 1962) : 34

²James F. Herendeen, "Let's Look At Methods," The School Musician 32 (September 1960) : 6
APPRAOCH TO THEORY

There should be written exercises that correlate with the musical playing fundamentals presented. Written counting exercises as well as writing in the names of notes are useful. Simple musical games such as crossword puzzles can be helpful as well as fun.

INCLUSION OF EXERCISES FOR FULL BAND

There should be exercises that can be played with small ensembles, as well as exercises that can be divided among the group to give a full band sonority. An overabundance of ensemble material at the expense of the basic fundamentals is undesirable since ensemble work must correlate with the general pace of the method.

RANGES OF THE EXERCISES

The first notes taught should be easily produced on all instruments. Brass parts should not extend too high and the clarion register for the clarinet should not be introduced until student success is attained in the chalumeau register.

EXERCISES FOR THE ACCOMMODATION OF INDIVIDUAL PROBLEMS

When specific problems appear for individual instruments, there should be exercises designed to help alleviate that particular problem. With flutes and
saxophones, for example, there should be exercises to help eliminate the fingering problem between c" and d".

**FINGERING CHARTS**

Fingering charts should be easy to read and located to facilitate constant reference. The charts should contain all of the notes that are taught in the method.

**GLOSSARY OF MUSICAL SIGNS AND TERMS**

This section is probably not often used by beginners but could be if stressed by the teacher. If there is a glossary, it should be simple enough to be understood by beginners. The teacher should indicate where it is located to the students.

**UNIQUE OR SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIALS**

Many methods offer additional material that correlate with the basic method. Some offer recordings of the exercises while others provide books comprising full band arrangements. Further consideration should be directed to any follow-up books that can be used after the student has completed the original method.
CHAPTER IV

EXAMINATION OF METHOD BOOKS

PRINTING

The size of the notes and printing in all of the methods was found to be acceptable. The paper used, even in the 1945 publication, is all of the highest quality making reading quite easy.

The use of different colors could be an important consideration for the director looking for variation in a method book. The Learning Unlimited was the only book examined that uses this technique. All exercises are color-coded. An exercise without a frame indicates unison material. A frame printed in color with music shaded in another color points out duet, trio, or quartet material, while a red and gray frame indicates full band exercises. New material in the Learning Unlimited is brought out in red ink. All of the other methods, while easy to read, are printed in black and white.

The color-coded process used to introduce new material in the Learning Unlimited is quite effective. The large amount of printing per page, however could be a drawback. To quote Barbara Buehlman, "an abundance of printed instructions and diagrams on many of the pages
may confuse the young beginner."¹ Nevertheless, color-coding is the main point separating the Learning Unlimited from the other five methods.

In the Belwin Elementary Band Method, new notes are indicated with a star above the note and the fingering written underneath. New problems and terms in the Belwin Elementary Band Method are labeled with a number in the box. The student can then look up the number in the index and read the explanation.

In contrast to this, the Hal Leonard Elementary Band Method simply labels new pitches as "New Notes" and indicates the correct fingering. New musical terms are labeled in a similar manner.

The First Division Band Method introduces new material with an oval. For example, the introduction of a new note is indicated . New ideas and hints in the First Division book are shown within a rectangular shaped box. For example:

```
Proper playing position is most important
```

An interesting idea concerning the introduction of new material is found in the Band Today book. In this method, all new material is printed in a rectangular shaped box with a hand, printed in solid black, pointing to the new concept or material.

¹Buehlman, p. 49
Perhaps the best technique of introducing new material is found in the Sessions in Sound book. Here, all new material is at the top of each lesson in very large boxes. Not only are new notes indicated and fingerings given, but pictures of the fingerings as well.

Too much printing on a page could be a major drawback of methods at the beginning level. This, however, is not a problem with the Belwin Elementary Band Method. In this book, most of the teaching techniques are left up to the teacher, thus avoiding a considerable amount of extra printing.

An overall cluttered effect can be found in the first ten pages of the Hal Leonard Elementary Band Method. Words to all of the songs are printed above and the fingerings for each note below. In the case of the woodwind books, the pages are quite confusing. This is not true for the entire Hal Leonard method, however, and the other methods did not have this problem to any great extent.

**PRECISE AND LOGICAL PRESENTATION OF FUNDAMENTALS**

The only method that offers no preliminary instruction is the Belwin Elementary Band Method. The method immediately starts with playing exercises, leaving the review of fundamentals to the teacher. New material is presented very gradually with quarter notes not being introduced until page 10 and eighth notes, until page 27.

The Hal Leonard Elementary Band Method is very similar to the Belwin Elementary Band Method with the
exception of a preparatory page covering the first few notes that will be taught. Other than this, no presentation of elementary music fundamentals is offered until page 9. From this point on, basic fundamentals are given as needed. New notes in the Hal Leonard Band Method are separated from the regular exercises so that they may be seen easily. The entire book remains very basic throughout. Eighth notes, in fact, are never introduced in this method.

The Band Today and the First Division Band Method have a very similar approach. Both methods have an introductory page giving the first notes to be used. This page is followed by a presentation of the basic fundamentals of music. Both the First Division Band Method and the Band Today book give a front and side view of each instrument with playing position. Eighth notes, in both books, are not introduced until page 21, and other new material is presented very clearly in a logical and meaningful order.

The Learning Unlimited book offers several steps of instrument assembly and production of the first tones. New material is printed in red stressing its importance. Eighth notes are not presented until page 51.

The most complete introduction is in the Sessions in Sound book. Here, there is an entire page of basic fundamentals including a front and side view of each instrument showing correct playing position. Included in the introduction is a section on assembling each instrument. An added feature is a section on instrument care, complete with a list of cleaning supplies. New fundamentals and
notes are given at the top of each lesson in large boxes.

**PROGRESSIVE ARRANGEMENT OF TEACHING MATERIAL**

All of the methods examined generally present material in a teachable order. Five of the methods use a graded approach in that all new material is continually added and built upon. The *Hal Leonard Band Method* is the only one that does not develop fundamentals into progressively more difficult exercises. The material in this method remains very simple. After the preliminary notes and simple exercises, the remainder of the book consists mostly of familiar and popular tunes. The writer, Harold Rusch, feels that these familiar tunes are very beneficial. Each tune has generally the same level of difficulty throughout the book.

The *First Division Band Method* and the *Band Today* books, because of their similarities, may be viewed together. The exercises in both books progress smoothly and with sufficient review of fundamentals. There are several short tunes that offer a deviation from the drill exercises. Included are exercises that feature soloists with band accompaniment and are very useful in the encouragement of individual leadership. The inclusion of soloist drills may foster a certain amount of competition among the group.

---

The Belwin Elementary Band Method progresses at a very comfortable rate. While using a great deal of review, this method still manages to move on to more difficult material. When fundamentals are developed by unison playing, they are immediately applied to musical selections, solos, or full band.

The Learning Unlimited provides review until the presentation of eighth notes. At this point, there is a shortage of sufficient review material. Included in the method are several duets, full band arrangements, and jazz band arrangements for additional interest. Less ensemble material, however, and more review would considerably improve this method.

The Sessions in Sound book would benefit with more review of the fundamentals before the new material is introduced. While fundamentals are presented logically, there should be more time to absorb what has already been taught. Each lesson in the Sessions in Sound book has several drill exercises and tunes although many of the tunes are actually drill exercises with a title.

RATE OF PROGRESSION

The most basic of the methods examined is the Hal Leonard Elementary Band Method. The book extensively drills whole, half, and dotted half notes, yet there is no presentation of eighth notes at all. Because of the review of elementary material, very few fundamentals are presented per page. This would be a good method for a slower group of
beginners where instruction is the most difficult.\textsuperscript{1}

The \textit{First Division Band Method} and \textit{The Band Today} books are, again, quite similar. The exercises in both books are elementary but progress faster than the \textit{Hal Leonard Elementary Band Method}.

The \textit{Learning Unlimited} book offers a very good layout of exercises until the very end. Here, some of the eighth note passages become technically difficult too soon after their presentation.

The \textit{Sessions in Sound} book introduces quarter and eighth notes too quickly. As a result, some beginners may find the exercises too rhythmically difficult. There are also two to four fundamentals presented on each page. It appears that the pace of the \textit{Sessions in Sound} book may be too fast.

The \textit{Belwin Elementary Band Method} uses whole, half, and dotted half notes until page ten. There are usually three or four fundamentals presented on each page. There are pages, however, on which no new material is presented.

\section*{Rhythmic Approach}

Teaching rhythm is the biggest problem in working with beginners and many different approaches have been used. Each method examined pursues a different approach.

The \textit{Belwin Elementary Band Method} begins with the

\textsuperscript{1}James F. Hererdeen, "Let's Look At Methods" \textit{The School Musician} 33 (November 1961) : 8
basic whole note, with no special teaching technique offered. The procedure for instruction of all other rhythms is also left up to the teacher. The order of rhythmic presentation is as follows: whole notes, half notes, dotted half notes, ties, and quarter notes. There is a review and reworking of these note values for sixteen pages. During this time, other fundamentals are also presented. The introduction of eighth notes is given in two ways (See Ex. 1).

Ex. 1. Belwin Elementary Band Method, p. 27

1. \[ \text{ } \]
2. \[ \text{ } \]

This is to show the different ways of notation that are possible. Other rhythmic patterns presented in the Belwin Method are (See Ex. 2).

Ex. 2. Belwin Elementary Band Method

\[ , , , , , \]

Time signatures in this method are taught as illustrated in Example 3 (See Ex. 3).

Ex. 3. Belwin Elementary Band Method

\[ 4, 3, C, 2, C, 3, 6 \]
\[ 4, 4, C, 4, C, 8, 8 \]
The Hal Leonard Elementary Band Method offers the weakest approach to rhythm. The introduction of note values is not given until page 11 with the emphasis to this point being on rote learning. The Hal Leonard Method teaches only whole notes, half notes, dotted half notes, ties, and quarter notes for the entire book. In addition, the following time signatures are taught (See Ex. 4).

Ex. 4. Hal Leonard Elementary Band Method

\[
\begin{array}{cccc}
4 & 3 & 2 & C \\
4, 4, 4, C
\end{array}
\]

The basic approach in the First Division Band Method begins with the whole note followed by the introduction of the quarter note. The next rhythmic presentations are the dotted half note, half note, and tie. Eighth notes in the First Division Method are presented with a familiar tune written in \( \frac{4}{4} \) followed by the same tune written in \( \frac{2}{4} \) using eighth notes. The counting is included under the eighth note exercises as follows (See Ex. 5).

Ex. 5. First Division Band Method, p. 21

\[
\begin{array}{c}
\begin{array}{ccc}
\text{I} & \text{I} \\
1 & 2 & 1
\end{array}
\end{array}
\]

The First Division Band Method does not present the dotted quarter note. Time signatures that are taught are (See Ex. 6):
Ex. 6. First Division Band Method

There are also exercises that offer a choice of time signatures \( \frac{2}{4} \). Without an explanation, a choice of meter signatures may be confusing to the beginner.

The Learning Unlimited offers a different and refreshing approach to counting. The basic rhythm in this method is given before the actual notes are presented (See Ex. 7).

Ex. 7. Learning Unlimited, p. 8.

This technique divides the beat from the beginning of the method and makes teaching of more complicated rhythms much easier.

In Learning Unlimited, quarter notes are presented first, followed by half notes and then whole notes. They are presented consecutively using the division of the beat, as diagrammed in example 7.

Ties in this method are taught using dotted half notes (See Ex. 8).
The teaching of eighth notes in the Learning Unlimited will now be much easier because of the previously taught division of the beat (See Ex. 9).

The Learning Unlimited book includes the following time signatures (See Ex. 10).

It should be noted that one counting aspect, the dotted quarter note pattern, is not covered in this method.

The Sessions in Sound book, as is done in many methods, begins with the whole note and whole rest which are presented in the following manner (See Ex. 11).
Ex. 11. Sessions in Sound, p. 7

Rhythm

- whole notes = 4 beats
- whole rests = 4 beats

All other basic note values in this book are presented in a similar way. The introduction of eighth notes in the Sessions in Sound method are done as follows (See Ex. 12).

Ex. 12. Sessions in Sound, p. 19

Unlike other books, the dotted quarter note is presented here and is diagrammed in the following manner (See Ex. 13).

Ex. 13. Sessions in Sound, p. 23

One of the most interesting aspects to the Sessions in Sound book is in its approach to time signatures. While teaching
unusual time signatures seldom presented in most elementary methods, the alla breve is not included (See Ex. 14).

Ex. 14. Sessions i: Sound

The Band Today book begins with the traditional whole note, merely indicating that it receives four counts. Half notes, quarter notes, and dotted half notes are treated in the same fashion. This book, though, offers a good approach to eighth notes and eighth rests (See Ex. 15).

Ex. 15. Band Today, p. 21

This particular technique points to the relationship between eighth rests and eighth notes. The dotted quarter note, though, is not taught in this method. Along with these counting patterns, the following time signatures are taught (See Ex. 16).
APPRAOCH TO THEORY

Written theory exercises are not viewed with much importance by writers of elementary band books. Of the methods examined, only the Sessions in Sound includes music theory instruction. The remaining five methods were so limited in written theory that it could have been left out all together.

The Belwin Elementary Band Method, for example provides only two music theory tests and both of them are very limited. The tests are, however, lengthy enough to cover all of the material presented up to that point in the book.

The Band Today book has only two written exercises, each one line long. They are very basic and could be useful if the student were given more opportunity for written practice. The following is an example of the first written exercise in the Band Today book (See Ex. 17).
Ex. 17. Band Today, p. 10

Identify the following:

\[ \text{Diagram of notes and fingerings} \]

The other exercise in the Band Today book requires students to name notes that are given above, and mark the fingerings below (See Ex. 18).


\[ \text{Diagram of notes and fingerings} \]

The First Division Band Method also uses two written exercises but these are almost identical to the ones in the Band Today book. In addition to the two exercises, however, there is a short musical game. This game gives the students a series of letters and asks them to match the letter with the proper note to spell out a tune, as follows (See Ex. 19).
The Learning Unlimited book also has only two written exercises. One is a crossword puzzle using all of the material that has been presented to that point, and the other is a word game that gives a message when the blanks are filled in (See Ex. 20).

Both exercises in the Learning Unlimited book are presented toward the beginning.

The Sessions in Sound book has no written exercises in the method itself. Theory exercises are included in a separate book, Pencil Sessions. There are seventeen separate projects, one per page. There is a place on each page for the student's name and instrument allowing individual pages to be removed from the book to be turned in. The exercises in the Pencil Sessions book cover the basic fundamentals very well. There are also musical games as well as crossword puzzles.
The **Hal Leonard Elementary Band Method** was the only book of the six examined that did not have any written theory exercises, projects, or games.

**INCLUSION OF EXERCISES FOR FULL BAND**

All of the methods use small ensemble material (duets, trios, and simple band arrangements) to some degree. One of the main objectives of small ensembles is the playing of different tones.¹

The **Learning Unlimited** book uses ensembles that can be played as duets or divided up among the entire band. There may be too much small ensemble material and not enough unison lines in this book. Because of all the duets and exercises with double notes (notes printed on top of each other) the pages appear cluttered. The **Learning Unlimited** book has several short and simple band arrangements in a variety of styles. There are also jazz band arrangements that are printed in imitation hand-written manuscript.

A good balance of ensemble playing can be found in the **Belwin Elementary Band Method**. There are duets and trios that can be played as such, or divided among the entire band. There are also several band arrangements that represent different styles of music. The important aspect is that the **Belwin Elementary Band Method** does not stress ensemble material at the expense of fundamentals. The ensembles,

rather, supplement the basic unison lines.

The Hal Leonard Elementary Band Method is very similar to the Belwin Elementary Band Method, but does not use quite as much ensemble material.

The Sessions in Sound book contains only two exercises that can be used as duets. There are, however, five full band arrangements at the end of the book including Christmas songs and other selections in various time signatures.

The Band Today and First Division Band Method are very similar. Each contain duets and full band exercises that are written mostly as accompaniment to other material. At the very end of the books, though, there are two full band arrangements, one a march and the other a waltz.

RANGES OF EXERCISES

The initial notes that beginners will be able to reach vary from student to student. The first notes of a method book, then, should be written within a range that most beginners will be able to easily obtain.

While the range of all instruments is important, special attention should be directed to those of the trumpets, French horns, and clarinets. High notes for these instruments should not be introduced too early.

Of the methods examined, five start in concert F, offering a comfortable beginning note for all instruments. The Hal Leonard Band Method is the only one that does not begin in the key of concert F. This method begins with notes
which are comfortable to produce but cannot be played in unison with the full band. The first notes in the Hal Leonard Elementary Band Method must be played in groups of like instruments. Unison material for the entire group does not begin for several pages. The ranges in this method remain very playable, especially the French horn book. The trumpet book does extend up to a written f" and g" but not until the very end. The Hal Leonard book does not go over the break for clarinets at all.

The First Division Band Method and the Band Today books are again very similar. The trumpet, in both books, does go to f" but, like the Hal Leonard Elementary Band Method, not until the end. A major problem lies in the French horn books. Sometimes the French horn lines are written in octaves. The high notes are often too high and the low octaves too low (See Ex. 21).

Ex. 21. First Division Band Method, Band Today

\[\text{\includegraphics{Ex21.png}}\]

The notes that are circled are considered out of range by this author. The clarinets, in both the First Division and Band Today book, are introduced to the clarion register by page 18.

The Belwin Elementary Band Method offers a particularly good French horn book in that the ranges are very
limited. The horn parts do not extend above c". The clarinet book in the Belwin Method works the low range very well. Crossing the break is introduced on page 18.

The Learning Unlimited book is written in readily playable ranges for all the instruments. The French horn part is particularly well written with the highest note being c". Like the other methods, the trumpet book reaches e" but not until the very end. Crossing the break for clarinets is not presented until page 46 which allows for plenty of preparation.

**EXERCISES FOR THE ACCOMMODATION OF INDIVIDUAL PROBLEMS**

The Belwin Elementary Band Method has two pages assigned to unique problems of individual instruments. The first covers crossing the break for clarinets. While the clarinetists are doing this, the brass are working on lip slurs. Other instruments are improving their slurring ability on the various intervals involved. At the same time, percussionists are working on flams. This page is scored so that all of the above exercises can be played simultaneously. The second page extends instrumental ranges and deals with like instruments only. Several scales and broken thirds are introduced here stressing different articulations. On this page, the percussionists are working on open and closed rolls.

The Hal Leonard Elementary Band Method does not offer many special exercises for individual problems. There are, however, six lines referred to as "Supplementary Studies" which are located on the last two pages. They include:
crossing the break for clarinet, lip slurs for brass, and a review of regular slurs for the other instruments. Because the exercises for crossing the break for clarinet are introduced at the end and are very short, this author does not feel that the clarion register for clarinet is adequately presented in this method.

Four major scales are also introduced in the Hal Leonard book: concert E-flat, B-flat, A-flat, and F. Because this book is so basic, several fingerings for these scales are supplied for the various instruments since they were not taught in the method book itself.

Once again, the First Division Band Method and Band Today books are similar. Each book has six one line studies. In the First Division book, they are called "Extras", and in the Band Today book they are entitled "Bonus Lines". While they are not identical, they do have very close similarities. They are generally for like instruments and are designed to cover material that will not fit in the lesson currently being presented to the entire group. These exercises consist of fingering drills, slurs, scales, and some alternate fingerings and slide positions. Percussionists, pursue exercises on rolls.

The Learning Unlimited and the Sessions in Sound books may be viewed together. Areas that may pose problems are labeled to warn the teacher. Solutions to individual problems in these methods are incorporated within the exercises themselves and the instructor must isolate any possible or future problems that may arise. It is the thinking of this writer that more review and isolation of fundamental material
should be included in both the Learning Unlimited and Sessions in Sound books.

FINGERING CHARTS

Fingering charts serve not only as a reference, but also as a valuable tool for students who want to work ahead. It is very important to show students where charts are located and give any explanation that will be needed. It cannot be assumed that the students will find them on their own.

Of the books examined, three have charts in the front and the other three have charts in the back. Those with the charts in the front include: the Belwin Elementary Band Method, the Hal Leonard Elementary Band Method, and the First Division Band Method. The methods with the charts in the back are: the Learning Unlimited book, the Sessions in Sound book, and the Band Today book. All the charts are simple to read and do not require much explanation.

Two of the methods have a rather novel approach. The Learning Unlimited gives the name of the note, its position on the staff, and a picture of the fingering as the student would be viewing his own instrument. All the fingerings are in color and delineated by boxes. Notes not taught in the Learning Unlimited book are printed in red.

Very similar to this chart is the one in the Sessions in Sound book. The only real difference is the Learning Unlimited is in color and the Sessions in Sound is not.

All of the charts are printed chromatically except
the Belwin Elementary Band Method. In this book, the chart is divided. Fingerings for accidentals are given on a separate staff.

Fingerings for enharmonic pitches are given in all of the charts. Each book explains that the chart contains only the notes that are going to be needed at this level.

GLOSSARY OF MUSICAL SIGNS AND TERMS

The glossary of musical signs and terms is often overlooked by teachers. If the students are shown where the glossary can be found and how it can be useful, it may have some value.

All of the methods had a glossary except the Hal Leonard Method. In the Hal Leonard musical terms and signs are introduced throughout the text. For example, between playing exercises there may be a heading, "MUSICAL TERMS", followed by perhaps three definitions.

The glossaries in the remaining five methods are found in the back of the books. The best of these is in the Belwin Elementary Method. In this method, there are seventy-five entries. When a term or symbol is introduced in the method book, it is given a number. The student can then find the term or sign in the numbered index. The glossary in the Belwin Elementary Method covers two pages and is very easy to read.

The glossary in the First Division Band Method is probably the least informative of the six methods. Entries are not numbered and, because of cluttered printing, are
difficult to read.

The glossary in the Band Today book is much better. Located in the back, each term is numbered and encased in separate rectangular boxes.

The glossary in the Learning Unlimited book covers about three-fourths of the page. The terms are not numbered but are in alphabetical order. Color-coding is again used in the Learning Unlimited book. For example: the musical symbol for an "accent" (>) is printed in red followed by the definition printed in black. The glossary in the Learning Unlimited book does, however, have a "cluttered" appearance.

Glossary entries in the Sessions in Sound book are in alphabetical order but are not numbered. Acceptable spacing provides a less cluttered appearance than in Learning Unlimited.

UNIQUE OR SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL

This section will deal with added advantages to the books examined. The intent is to list any supplementary materials that exist and can be used as an addition to the basic elementary method.

The Belwin Elementary Band Method offers no recordings. There are, however, two suggested supplementary books: Fun for All and Band At Play.

The First Division Band Method now has cassette recordings available of the basic lesson book. Several supplementary books may also be used with this method:

1. Fun With Fundamentals (technique book)
2. *Away We Go* (program book)

3. *Ensembles for Everyone* (ensemble training)

4. *Concert Band Arrangements* (program book)

The *Band Today* book offers no recordings but does have several supplementary books:

1. *Technique Today* (technique book)

2. *Concert Today* (program book)

3. *Concert Band Selections* (program book)

4. *Band-Sembles* (ensemble training)

5. *Notes For Today* (rudimentary theory - to read, write and play)

While the *Learning Unlimited* series does not have recordings available, it does offer an individualized book with cassette recordings that can be used separately or in conjunction with the class series. In both the cassette series and the class series of the *Learning Unlimited*, there is a chart that shows each fundamental and its exact location in each book. Two other supplements to the *Learning Unlimited* are:

1. *Arrangements for Concert Band*

2. *Arrangements for Jazz Band*

Other than the previously mentioned *Pencil Sessions*, the *Sessions in Sound* only has one supplementary book available called *Solo Sessions* offering cassette recordings in the form of a band accompaniment allowing a student to play as soloist with the tape.

The *Hal Leonard Elementary Band Method* does not offer any special features at all.
CONCLUSION

The selection of a method book must be done in more than a random manner. One must have specific objectives in mind when selecting the best possible method book in order to satisfy the required needs.

The six elementary band methods cited in this paper have advantages and disadvantages. Generally speaking, however, all of the methods reviewed have a good basic approach. It is not until the 1970's that new innovations begin to appear in method books. The basics of music remain the same, it is the approach that is beginning to change. Many new attractions can now be found in the newer methods. Some of the new techniques include: (1) use of colors, (2) novelty exercises, (3) musical games, (4) jazz band arrangements, (5) theory books, (6) recordings, (7) better introduction to fundamentals, (8) more innovative fingering charts.

Even with the new concepts, there is still room for improvement. The later methods which stand out in some criteria, remain weak in others. A possible solution to the dilemma may be to use more than one method book and technique of teaching or select the best possible method and provide separate hand-outs to help with specific problems that arise. After years of use, the hand-outs may themselves form a complete supplementary method book.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Herendeen, James F. "Let's Look At Methods." The School Musician 32 (September 1960) : 6

Herendeen, James F. "Let's Look At Methods." The School Musician 33 (November 1961) : 8

Herendeen, James F. "The Recruitment and Motivation of Band Beginners." The School Musician 44 (March 1973) : 52

Herendeen, James F. "Beginner Drop-Out Survey." The School Musician 46 (October 1974) : 31


Montgomery, Clyde Jr. "Criteria For Selecting Method Books For Beginners." The School Musician 50 (January 1979) : 45


Sperry, Gale L. "The Importance of a Band Course of Study." *The School Musician* 34 (September 1962) : 34

