

**UNITY IN NUMBERS:
THE ARCHAEOLOGY OF THE DEMIMONDE (1840-1917)**

MEGAN SHARPLESS

MAY 2008

A SENIOR THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE
REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF BACHELOR OF SCIENCE IN
ARCHAEOLOGICAL STUDIES
UNIVERSITY OF WISCONSIN – LA CROSSE

Abstract

Prostitution served as a logical economic career choice for women in the nineteenth-century due to a lack of prosperous labor options. It offered the hope of a modest economic status and autonomy for women despite the societal isolation, prejudices, and health risks, associated with the trade. Recent archaeological excavations of brothels offer a more complete understanding of these working-class and marginalized women. Material evidence of their daily lives can further expand our knowledge in such areas and contextualize the narratives of historical analysis. A limited but growing field in historical contract archaeology of vice and Red-Light districts, in cities such as New York, Washington, D.C., New Orleans, and Los Angeles, can help explain various aspects of class, gender, and sexuality, in this time period. The investigation and interpretation of the material record provides crucial evidence into the residences of these women. By taking a look at parallel and unparallel patterns and associations in artifact assemblages, a clearer understanding of what constitutes—brothel material culture in the nineteenth-century—can be more clearly defined. The categories of my results included faunal remains, ceramics, pharmaceutical accoutrements, child-related artifacts, and personal items. The history and analyses of prostitution covers the oldest female labor trade in the world.

Methods

Methodological focus was research-based. Chronology of the time period defined the data portion. The examination of the artifact assemblages uncovered at nineteenth-century brothel sites included: Washington D.C.'s Mary Ann Hall's parlor house site (1840-1870) and "Hookers Division" sites, New York's "Five Points" Neighborhood (1843-1910, Los Angeles "Red-Light" district parlor house and "crib" sites (1880-1901), and a New Orleans's Storyville "crib" site (1905-1917). A comparative analysis was conducted between differing typologies of artifacts: diet (faunal analysis), ceramic types and variations, accoutrements surrounding infant care, disease, and pharmaceutical-related paraphernalia, and some such personal items. Three out of the five site locations referred to in this thesis already have their own methods of analysis compared to adjacent working and middle-class households. Examination of these four North American regional sites can further determine exclusivity of artifacts between brothel and non-brothel residences. The contents of this paper was attained through correspondence with historical contract archaeologists, books on sexuality and gender in archaeology, publications on gender-related studies and preservation work, published articles pertaining to the topic as well as historical and autobiographical accounts.

Prostitution served as a logical economic career choice for women in the nineteenth-century due to a lack of more attractive labor options. Commercial sex offered the hope of a modest (and occasionally lucrative) economic status and autonomy for women; however detrimental the societal prejudices and health risks that were associated with the trade. Recent historical analysis in archaeology has offered a more comprehensive understanding of these working-class and marginalized women during this time period.

Archaeological material culture further expands our knowledge of the historical past and contextualizes the narratives of the women who turned to a career in prostitution.

Archaeological scholar, Catherine Holder Spude argues that:

Within the last decade, historical archeology has become an increasingly useful tool for elucidating gender studies. Men's and women's lives, relationships, roles and their functions in communities have changed through time [...] This potential is especially great when dealing with working-class people of both genders who have failed to leave a written record of their lives (Spude 2005).

The recent archaeological focus of brothels in the nineteenth and early twentieth-centuries has primarily stemmed out of Cultural Resource Management (CRM), most often referred to as "contract" archaeology. Scholars in the fields of historical archaeology and history (Costello et al. 1999, Seifert 1991, Spude 2005, Yamin 1997, Gilfoyle 1987) have contributed greatly to the study of historical prostitution since the onset of the Industrial Revolution.

The importance of contract archaeology has increased rapidly in the past three decades due to an increase in construction associated with business growth, the expansion of public transit and freeway systems, a growing awareness of prehistoric and historic documentation and preservation work, and an overall understanding to the importance of

fostering American historic landmarks. The intellectual interest that historical scholars have placed on the “underworld” culture of the nineteenth-century signals a turning point in the varieties of historical analysis in archaeology. Due to inner-city growth, CRM related projects have exposed sections of metropolitan cities that might have otherwise gone unnoticed. The routine nature of contract archaeology has developed further insight into the sects of working-class society and, particularly, the prostitution trade. Historical scholar, Timothy J. Gilfoyle stated, “Archeologists are uncovering in exacting detail the material culture of the daily lives of prostitutes, clients, and other participants in the 19th-century sex industry” (Gilfoyle 2005).

Perhaps more rhetoric than reality American society in the nineteenth-century was ripe with the notion of individual opportunity and economic prosperity. However, this idealistic mythology “individual opportunity” was catered toward a decidedly more patriarchal society than exists in the United States today. Self-reliant women were faced with much tougher economic decisions, and the forces that led women into prostitution varied. Although “societal norms” opposed houses of prostitution they were, in fact, greatly frequented businesses. The politics surrounding prostitution during this time in American history are controversial; yet chief in understanding how the “underworld” maintained its power, and even flourished in this period.

The field of historical archeology allows for further understanding into how prostitution coexisted with mainstream society, and sheds some light on how women lived in the brothels. Material evidence uncovered at North American brothel sites reflects the everyday culture of the inhabitants. Pertaining to an excavation that took place at a nineteenth-century brothel site in Saint Paul, Minnesota, archaeologists

described, “The artifacts used by the customers and the residents are apparent in vessel types, faunal remains, and other artifact types, and all contribute to the reality of the day-to-day lives of the residents” (Ketz et al. 2005).

Prostitution is the oldest female professional trade in the world. Recent historical archaeology provides alternative and additional interpretations from that of the written historical record. According to historian, Timothy Gilfoyle:

[...] Historians of prostitution confront great difficulties in reconstructing accurate accounts of the past, due to the added layers of myth and fabrication. Because the “whore” was also a metaphor, commercial sex was transformed into a vehicle by which elites and middle classes articulate their social boundaries, problems, fears, agendas, and visions. Consequently, most sources are so embedded in disclosures of pleasure, reform, and regulation that any effort to reconstruct the lived experiences of these women is nearly impossible (Gilfoyle 1999).

The combination of both agencies—archaeology and history—can help bridge some unrecognized aspects to gender, economic, and sexuality-related issues during the mid-1800’s and turn of the twentieth-century. This thesis was tailored around four nineteenth-century North American brothel sites: Mary Ann Hall’s parlor house in Washington, D.C., a working-class brothel in New York’s “Five Points,” a parlor house in downtown Los Angeles’s Red-Light district, and a New Orleans Storyville “crib” residence. The differentiation between a brothel and a “crib” in this era was substantial as prostitutes did not generally reside in the “cribs” like they did in brothels and parlor houses. Yet New Orleans Storyville seems to contradict these noted generalizations. The Storyville “crib” site was, in fact, a place of residence due to the high counts of ceramics and evidence of food and personal items. Ryan Gray of Earth Search, Inc., who ran artifact analysis on the Storyville site states that the “The artifacts were recovered from “crib” homes rather than brothels per se” (Ryan Gray, personal communication 2008).

However, contrary to the Storyville site the majority of the Los Angeles “cribs” were not home residences; the artifacts found at this location upholds this general theory due to the sparse amounts of artifacts collected from the supposed *Easy Jeanette Street* site. Historically, in Los Angeles, it was custom for the women to rent out a room “on the row.” City “cribs” were referred to as “rows” because they were stationed side by side in long brick buildings resembling rows. A prostitute’s clientele entered a “crib” for one sexual service alone—without the accompaniments of entertainment of food or drink—whereas brothels offered music, alcohol, dining, conversation *and* sex. In Los Angeles, a woman who ran her own “crib” separated her “work life” from her “home life” and might have chosen “crib” life for such reasons (as well as for financial reasons). Clientele who chose “cribs” over brothels did so because it cost significantly less money to receive the services rendered.

To reside in a brothel or a parlor house was a *lifestyle* not solely a rest stop to make money off of commercial sex. However, throughout the western frontier women were also known to reside in a house for a short time, collect some savings, and then move on to find work elsewhere. A boarding house often referred to as a “board” or “bordello,” was run by a madam who made it her sole business to bring in money as well as provide shelter and safety to “her girls.” Some madams hired a body guard also known as a “pimp” to protect the women from violence, rape, murder, and theft. A madam provided laundry, meals, and other household activities and chores, related to home life taking sums it cost to provide these measures out of the girl’s earnings; all additional costs were deducted. A brothel or boarding house for sex work was foremost a place of business, but also a home to the employees hence the phrase *unity in numbers* in the title

of this thesis. A woman functioning in the prostitution trade was far less isolated in this line of work living in a brothel or parlor house rather than on the streets or in a “crib.” She had the various commonalities of the trade alongside other women as well as the protection from the madam from outside threats and foes.

Documented accounts of San Francisco Madam, Jessie Hayman (1906), suggest such social nuances in the brothel. Historical author, Chris Enss describes:

The chorus of girls in Jessie’s care considered her to be the best madam in the business. She was kind and fair, but strict and honest in all her dealings. One of the house favorites boasted that “Jessie was the tops, and when you worked for her, you were tops in the business.” Jessie’s reputation for being a good madam attracted many girls to her parlor house. She always had more applicants than available positions. Many wanted to work for her because they had heard how generous she was to her staff. If more than average amounts of alcohol were consumed during special parties and celebrations, Jessie paid her girls a 5 percent commission from the profits. The girls were also allowed to keep tips they made for serving clients meals cooked at the house (Enss 2006).

The physical appearance of the brothel was significantly important to the madam. She prescribed to social customs of nineteenth-century Victorian cultural standards, and upheld these appearances in the brothel setting. The parlor house sites (Mary Ann Hall’s and 327 Aliso Street in Los Angeles) attest to higher economic standards. The image and presentation of class was of paramount importance. The finer wares of ceramics as well as the varieties of unique foods might account for embellishments put forth in nineteenth-century brothels; it is possible that overcompensation of niceties maintained reputation inside the house in contrast to social prejudices outside the house.

The remainder of this paper will explore in detail other material aspects of working and middle-class houses of prostitution. The analyses of artifacts include the categories of faunal remains, ceramics, pharmaceutical supplies and medicinal remedies

for disease and prophylactic use, and miscellaneous personal items. Furthermore, focus on remnants of children's toys and infant care implements, such as breast pumps, show evidence of childrearing in houses of prostitution. Such data implies that parlor houses and brothels were, in fact, households not only for commercial sex but familial quarters for women to raise their children.

DATA

Washington, D.C.'s Mary Ann Hall: a High-End Brothel (Historical documents state that the house operated from 1840-1870; artifacts date to 1860 through 1870)

A contract archaeology project was carried out by John Milner Associates in Washington, D.C. (Seifert et al. 1998). "The excavation was to assist the Smithsonian Institution in complying with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966 and the Smithsonian Institution's National Museum of the American Indian opened in 2004 on the National Mall" (Seifert and Balicki 2005). Madam Hall's brothel was discovered in this location during the excavation process (across the street from the state capitol).

Historical and documentary accounts depicted that Mary Ann Hall's brothel operated from the years 1840 through 1870 (O'brien 2005) and possibly even as late as 1883 (Seifert et al. 2000). The analysis of Mary Ann Hall's brothel was matched against four other archaeological investigations in Washington, D.C. (both brothels and non-brothels), one of which included D.C.'s historical *Hooker's Division* (Seifert and Balicki 2005). Hooker's Division was D.C.'s Red-Light district from 1890 to 1914 and was nick

named after General Joseph Hooker, (a Civil War general) who briefly led the “Army of the Potomac” (Seifert 1991). It was common practice during the Civil War era for off-duty soldiers traveling into Washington to scout out theatres, saloons, and brothels for activity and amusement (Seifert 1991).

The neighboring households that were excavated in D.C. proper consisted of a range of occupants from middle and working-class sect (prostitutes as well as non-prostitutes). However, inconclusive data marked the working-class deposits. The most reliable data was supplied from middle-class occupant assemblages so the majority of Mary Ann Hall’s residence was compared to these assemblages (Seifert and Balicki 2005). System studies and methods were modeled after Stanley South (1997), George Miller’s ceramic index (1980), and Susan Henry’s turn of the century catalogs (1987). South’s results were limited to gross comparisons so further techniques were used to recognize economic values and purchasing patterns of the assemblage. The “highest percentages were from Hall’s brothel and from middle-class households on square 350” (Seifert and Balicki 2005).

Faunal Remains

The archaeological deposits that were uncovered at Mary Ann Hall’s brothel verified that lavish displays of material presentation were intrinsic to the lifestyle. Both faunal and ceramic analysis indicated that expensive and moderate cuts of beef, pork, and mutton (adult sheep), were consumed in the brothel as well as birds, turtles, and fish (Seifert et al. 2000). The variety of the skeletal remains showed rare varieties of foods,

most likely purchased from local vendors. The primary meat staples consisted of beef (42%), pork (37%), and mutton (21%). The cuts ranged in price from expensive to moderate. Hens were also present in the material record; most likely for egg supply (Seifert and Balicki 2005).

Faunal Remains Diagram

Methodologies differ subsequent to site (BROAD comparisons)

	Years	BEEF	PORK	SHEEP	FISH	FOUL	FRUIT	VEGET /NUT
New York	1840-1870	47%	37%	1%	Turtle	Hen	Raspberry Elderberry Strawberry Fig Grape Plum Cherry Apple	Squash Beans Walnut Coconut Brazilian nut
Wash D.C.	1843	% Mammal	% Mammal	% Mammal	42%	MAMMAL 50%	9%	
	Specie →				Oyster Clams	Dog Cat Rabbit Squirrel Rodent	Duck Goose Pigeon Turkey	
Los Angeles	1888-1905	65%	5%	20%	FISH 4%	SHELL FISH 4%	Chicken 5%	
	Specie →				Salmon Cod Mackeral Halibut Sheephead Barracuda Whitefish	Atlantic Oyster Eastern Oyster Pacific Oyster Black Abalone Green Abalone Pacific Scallop Pismo Clam Thatched Barnacle		
New Orleans	1898 - 1917	Incomplete	Data					

Mary Ann Hall's parlor house had far more diversity in their faunal and floral remains than neighboring households of the time (Seifert and Balicki 2005). Plant remains consisted of several different types of fruits (raspberry, elderberry, strawberry, fig, grape, plum, cherry, apple, coconut, peach), vegetables (squash and beans), and walnuts (Seifert and Balicki 2005). When compared with surrounding working and middle-class residences in the neighborhood, the exotic ingredients of vegetables, berries, such as Brazilian nuts and coconuts set this site apart from the rest (Seifert et al. 2000). According to the faunal analysis conducted, archaeologists assert:

The Phytolith and macrofloral evidence suggests that beans and berries were cultivated on Lot 11, where the midden accumulated, and the brothel may have kept laying hens, either on Lot 11, or in the backyard of Lot 12 (Seifert et al. 2000).

The diverse array of food remains found at Mary Ann Hall's brothel portray a particularly higher economic class to that of surrounding D.C. middle and working-class sects as well as the several brothel sites formerly analyzed in "Hookers Division." Hall's high-class brothel was announced in the provost marshal's list of *bawdy houses* in the city records. The marshal's account of Madam Hall's place was subsequently defining as he relayed that her place was "one of the truly private brothels," pinpointing her bordello as "first-class" and likely unbeknownst to her next door neighbors (Seifert et al. 2000).

Ceramics

The ceramic material assemblage found in the refuse at Hall's parlor house revealed similar economic themes. A full half of the wares found in the assemblage were porcelain and ironstone which were typical of upper and middle-class residences. In the

porcelain assemblage, most were white and colorless in pattern opposed to decorative illustrations and motifs, and lacked matching sets. However, a small faction did exhibit gilt-decorated markings near the rim. The gilded pieces consisted of saucers, plates, and cups (Seifert and Balicki 2005). Much of the kitchen table wares were of the Gothic style which were also designated to plain white, paneled cups, and saucers. In comparison with the other residences which prescribed to porcelain and whitewares, Madam Hall's assemblage was accustomed to porcelain and more costly ironstone brands (Seifert et al. 2000).

The function of the ceramics suggests that a percentage of the wares were being used 1) to entertain the clientele and 2) for the respective women residing in the household. This analysis stemmed from the significant difference between economic ranges of the vessels. Seifert and her colleagues describe:

It seems more likely that the gilt-decorated porcelains were used for visitors to the house. In her choices of tablewares and foods, Hall clearly created the elegant environment designed to attract clients with the ability to pay for luxury. [...] The brothel collection is also unusual in its high percentages of redware, yellowware, and stoneware food-preparation and storage vessels. These utilitarian wares account for 30 percent of the brothel collection, but only 10 to 19 percent of the comparative collections. The high percentages of two expensive tablewares and three utility wares supports the conclusion that the brothel was preparing and serving meals to large household of inmates and to clients. The high percentage of kitchen-groups artifacts in the brothel collection supports this interpretation as well. [...] Analysis of vessel forms also provides data useful in understanding household function. Vessel forms were divided into seven general classes that reflect the functions of ceramics vessels, personal hygiene vessels, vessels not associated with food, and unidentified forms (Seifert et al. 2000).

Such faunal and ceramic analysis concludes that Madam Mary Ann Hall used deliberate business tactics in entertaining her customers. The studies exhibit a conscious separation between social diplomacies regards business strategy and home life of the

women. The differing uses of functions suggest that expensive serving wares could have been used for clientele and the less valuable wares were designated for private household use.

Pharmaceutical and Medicinal Components

At Mary Ann Hall's site, Seifert's categorical methodology of vessels includes pharmaceutical and hygiene bottles with kitchen wares. Due to the unclassified nature of these results, detailed percentages of medicinal bottles and types are not available for comparisons. However, Seifert has released comprehensive detail of a brothel site in "Hooker's Division," which explains artifacts pertaining to hygiene. Seifert explains:

Although cosmetic and pharmaceutical bottles are included in the kitchen group in this analysis (as they are in other Washington, D.C. collections), they are worth mentioning here. A perfume-bottle stopper and a *Fletcher's Castoria* bottle were identified in the working-class assemblage. Cosmetics from the brothel assemblage include *Putnam's White Satin Bouquet* and *Chesebrough Mfg. Co. Vaseline*; pharmaceutical bottles include *Mrs. Winslow Soothing Syrup*, *Bromo Seltzer*, and *Valentine's Meat Juice*, said to be a cure for social diseases (Seifert 1991).

These nineteenth-century medicinal bottles point to attempts made by the women to independently care for their gynecological health. It is known that Vaseline was used for feminine health ailments and was central to the commercial sex trade (Meyer et al. 2005). Historical documents also reveal that a women's health center was located on Mary Ann Hall's property from 1883 until her death in 1886 (Seifert et al. 2000).

Personal Items

Personal items representative of a brothel were uncovered at Mary Ann Hall's. And, though small amounts (1%), items include clothing, jewelry, broken mirror pieces, hair pins, combs, jewelry fragments, writing implements, and coins (Seifert and Balicki 2005). These types of objects reflect the private life of the women; both grooming supplies as well as mundane tokens of day to day life.

New York's "Five Points:" a Working-Class Brothel (Closed down in 1843)

Historic Conservation and Interpretation (a consulting firm in New Jersey) led the excavation work in New York's historical "Five Points" neighborhood (Yamin 1997). The archaeological analysis was done by John Milner Associates in Philadelphia and was assigned under the contract of the General Services Administration (a federal agency), responsible for constructing and managing government buildings. The project was enacted due to the building of a new Federal court house at Foley Square in lower Manhattan; a total of fourteen city lots were inspected (Yamin 1997).

In the early to mid nineteenth-century, the brothel stood at 12 Orange Street (lot 43 of Baxter Street today), and was one of the three streets that formed New York's "Five Points" junction (Yamin 2005). Prostitution was considered commonplace in the "Five Points" during the first half of the nineteenth-century (Milne and Crabtree 2001).

American Historian Timothy Gilfoyle states,

Much evidence argues that commercial sex functioned at the nexus of social relations in community life, especially in the industrial city after

1800 [...] and in ambiguous, paradoxical, and controversial ways, prostitution represented a critical, ongoing conflict between individual freedom and community norms (Gilfoyle 2005).

Historical archaeologist, Rebecca Yamin, remarked on William W. Sanger's mid nineteenth-century studies, which depicted the underlying complexities of New York's hierarchy of prostitution (Yamin 2005):

The highest class of house, the parlor house, was furnished with a lavish display of luxury but not good taste ... large mirrors, gilt, paintings and engravings, vases and statuettes. The prostitutes – three-quarters of them natives of the United States – in such establishments paid from \$10 to \$16 a week to live there, worked from noon to midnight or later, drank champagne with their clients, wore fashionable clothes, and were provided with a neat and well arranged breakfast at about 11 or 12 o'clock and dinner at 5 or 6 by an experienced staff of servants usually colored. A second class of house attempted the same standard as the first class but was not as lavish. The prostitutes included women whose charms had begun to fade and the foreign born. The women drank wine and brandy instead of champagne and put up with less-experienced servants. The third grade, prevalent in the city's less fashionable districts including Five Points, was equal in all respects to the second class and sometimes superior (Sanger 1939).

The prostitution trade had its own hierarchy of respectability and reputability. Primarily, the "house rules" were enforced by the property madam. The parlor house was the most distinguished in the trade, brothels in the middle, "cribs" mid to low, and street workers the lowest of the economic ladder. As in any business, the service rendered was dependent on how much a customer was able to pay.

Faunal Remains

The "Five Points" faunal analysis involved meat, fowl, and fish remains and determined NISP (number of identified specimens per taxon), MNI (minimum number of

individuals), and MNMC (minimum number of retail meat cuts). The faunal remains were then matched with their meat type and corresponded to the National Meat Board's detailed instructions on the fabrication and butchering of animal carcasses (Milne and Crabtree 2001). These methods allowed for an overall pattern analysis that could characterize the faunal assemblages from excavations.

The earliest level (1843) of the privy was the location of John Donahue's cellar brothel (lot 43), and "was circular and stone-lined (on the back lot between numbers 10 and 12 Orange Street" (Milne and Crabtree 2001). The overall brothel assemblage at the Orange Street site location included 7,380 skeletal remains defined as "food bones." Of the entire 7,380 remains, 2,764 were unidentified classes of skeletal debris. An estimated half of the 7,380 were made up of mammals such as cattle, sheep, pigs, dogs, cats, rabbit, squirrel, and various rodents. Forty two percent were in the fish category, and 9% of the remains were birds including duck, goose, pigeon, and turkey. A substantial amount of large mammals were collected inclusive of cattle, sheep, and pig remains. Systems statistics reveal that the majority of food in the brothel was made up of ham second to sheep (34%) and cattle (22%). The high quantities of pig suggest that someone on the back lots of Orange Street could have been raising and butchering small livestock. This trade was common in early nineteenth-century New York during this period as well as surrounding northeastern territories (Milne and Crabtree 2001).

The figures also suggest that expensive cuts of meat such as veal, beef short loin, mutton loin, and rack of mutton, were all prevalent in consumption in the brothel as were more moderate and inexpensive meat types such as pork cuts, picnic hams, pork foreshank/hocks, beef arm, mutton neck, and pig's feet. Overall, however the prostitutes

of Orange Street ate affluently or served their clients affluently (Milne and Crabtree 2001).

Fish was also a primary food staple at the 10 and 11 Orange Street residences. It was noted that 42% of the bones recovered at the site were fish, and the assemblage is unique for its twenty-two different species. Among these groups were the porgy or scup, flounder, a variety of bass (stripers, black sea bass, perch), bluefish, codfish, mackerel, shad, herring, blackfish, Atlantic Cod, haddock, whiting, plaice, gray grunard, halibut, and salmon (most costly of the bunch) (Milne and Crabtree 2001). Fifty-two pounds of shell fish were recovered from the privy. The earliest deposit exhibited 36 pounds and was comprised of shellfish, oyster, hard and soft shell clams, scallops, slipper shells, limpets, and whelks (Milne and Crabtree 2001). The non-consumption animals consisted of 10 cats, 1 dog, and 9 rats (Milne and Crabtree 2001).

The interpretation of the brothel artifact assemblage was differentiated in contrast with its working-class neighbor who was a Polish Rabbi (both a scribe and tailor) and a carpenter (Milne and Crabtree 2001). On the opposite side of the block from the Carpenter and Rabbi, a large privy deposit was uncovered in association with the Orange Street residence and was recognized to be the location of the brothel due to its distinguishable artifact contents (Milne and Crabtree 2001). Among the mass privy discard, “The association of the brothel was somewhat complicated,” but according to documentary literature, “Two of the tenants at the Orange Street address swore out a complaint against a “disorderly house” run by a third tenant. The documented complaint led to the District Attorney’s indictment of John Donahue and the presumed closure of this particular brothel in 1843 (Milne and Crabtree 2001).

John Donahue was indicted for running a cellar brothel at 12 Baxter Street, one of the lots investigated within the courthouse block in lower Manhattan. The indictment describes:

A disorderly house—a rest for prostitutes and others of ill fame and name, where great numbers of characters are in the nightly practice of reveling until late and improper hours of the night, dancing, drinking, and carousing (Yamin 2005).

Yamin noted that Timothy J. Gilfoyle found the original records of the complaint mentioned above when writing his book, *City of Eros*. Gilfoyle relayed to Yamin that the complaint was made by 2 tenants one of which lived at 12 ½ (Edward Blackall) and 10 Orange Streets (Robert J. Gordon). New York District Attorney Leonard N. Whiting was responsible for the indictment of John Donoho (Yamin 2005).

Ceramics

A little over two-hundred ceramic fragments were uncovered at the Orange Street site location. Table and dishware ranging anywhere from inexpensive to extravagant existed in the material collection. Yamin describes, “The fanciness of the ceramics included a complete Chinese porcelain tea set” and “while not unique, it is as elegant as the porcelains recovered on sites associated with upper-class New Yorkers” (Yamin 2005). In addition to the tea set, the assemblage included punch cups, a wine coaster, and serving pieces that included two decanters. The analyzed tableware vessels included the assortment of plates, soups, twiffles, muffins, platters, dishes, and tureens. Forty-two percent of the pieces were shell-edged, 15 matched the landscape willow design, 8 made

up the landscape canton or plain Chinese porcelain, and 25 were printed type wares (Yamin 2005).

The “tea time” vessels in the collection were made up of teacups, saucers, slop bowls, coffee cups, pots, and a tea caddy. Five were landscape porcelain design, 28 were glazed floral porcelain, 56 pieces were landscape-related art, 28 were floral porcelain, and the remainders were of non-porcelain floral and Lafayette motifs (Yamin 2005).

Interesting depictions of political life was also illustrated on many of the serving tablewares found in the brothel. Yamin describes, “Perhaps the brothels ceramics, decorated with scenes of war and patriotism—Commodore McDonough’s 1814 victory on Lake Champlain during the War of 1812, Lafayette contemplating the tomb of Benjamin Franklin, and the inscription, “E Pluribus Unum”—appealed to clients’ sense of civic pride” (Yamin 1997).

Table Below: Ceramics Data

Ceramics Diagram

Methodologies differ subsequent to site (BROAD comparisons)

CATEGORY		TABLEWARE	TEAWARE	TYOLOGY	NOTES
Washington D.C.	Mary Ann Hall's Methodology combined Alcohol & Medicinal bottles with Kitchenware	1. TABLEWARE 31.73% 3. FOOD PREP 13.31%	2. TEAWARE 21.81% 4. SERVING 15.86%	TYPE% 29.24% Ironstone 26.61% Porcelain 14.91% Redware 11.69% Whiteware 9.32% Yellowware 6.60% Stoneware	Compared with other D.C. brothels as well as middle and working-class sites
New York	105 Alcohol Bottles 99 wine/5 beer 1 whiskey bottle 1 bottle coaster 2 punch cups 1 mini-flask	98 Items 8 porcelain 25 printed 15 landscape 42 shell-edged	128 Items 33 porcelain 30 floral 56 landscape 1 In tact Tea Caddy 1 porcelain Tea Set	TYPE % 42% shell-edged 41% porcelain 56% landscape 28% floral 28% glaze	Compared with neighboring working-class households
Los Angeles	147 Alcohol Bottles (15%) 66 goblets & wine glasses	102 Items	7 Cups & Mugs	55 porcelain (45%) 55 Earthenware	Compared with neighboring working-class households
New Orleans	Bottles Not Distinguished From Medicinal Use	Moderate Number of Ceramics; Wares not Listed	102 coffee pots	5 porcelain 205 Ironstone 89 Whiteware 14 Stoneware 5 Yellowware 3 Redware 3 Brownware 1 Rockinghamware	1. Not "a controlled Excavation/ Trench had been excavated by construction co. by the time archaeologists were called to site 2. Investigations consisted of documentation & salvage (Gray 2008)

Certainly, these types of kitchen wares were common of the period and not necessarily indicative of a brothel, in particular, however the illustrations displayed, according to Yamin present a “genteel décor [that] would have made the middle-class men feel right at home” (Yamin 1997), and the “The “staff” at No. 12 Orange Street probably came from the working-class, but the artifacts from Feature AG indicated that an effort was being made to present another image, one more conducive to attracting a middle-class clientele” (Yamin 2005).

Personal Items

The personal items found at the site were also crucial in understanding the lifestyle of the women in a New York “Five Points” brothel. Some of them included: a Stiletto sewing box (for piercing holes in fabric or whitework), a bond handle of an embroidery tool, knitting needle covers, a thread winder, and beads for thread bobbins to mend petticoats and stockings and embroider handkerchiefs and sleeves (Yamin 1997). Dress, scent, fashion, and hygiene, all played a big role in brothel establishments and in order to have employed successful business; appearances had to be nurtured and upheld. Among the artifacts that pertained to these “upkeeps” were several perfume bottles from both New York and French manufacturers. Yamin addresses in her report, “The resident working-class prostitutes manipulated accoutrements of gentility to attract a bourgeois clientele” (Yamin 2005).

Pharmaceutical and Medicinal Components

Contemporaneous with the awareness of cultural appearances and material presentation in the brothel were critical concerns regarding health. Again, preventive measures centering on gynecological and physical care ran parallel with the sex work. Large amounts of medicinal remedies and implements of this nature were uncovered during the excavation. “Hundreds of medicine bottles, most of them “New York Dispensary,” which distributed medicine free to the poor, once held “female restoratives” and cures for cholera and coughs” (Yamin 1997). Among the privy artifacts were female

urinals that would have been used to accommodate bathroom release if a woman was bed-ridden from a venereal disease (Yamin 1997). Various ingredients and indicators of health-related artifacts were uncovered suggesting deliberate usage of preemptive measures. Michael Bonasera, a glass analyst on the excavation, asserts that advertisements of this nature were common of the period (Yamin 2005), and described such medicinal bottles as an indication of “relief from constipation, diarrhea, asthma, bronchitis, skin diseases, dyspepsia, diabetes, kidney, urinary tract infections, etc.” (Yamin 2005).

New York’s “Five Points” material record offer additional clues relating to birth control and venereal disease prevention. A ceramic pot with the term “Amaille” was written on it (indicating vinaigrier), which was common as a douche. A syringe was uncovered that revealed the nature and appearance of modern day prophylactic equipment. Foremost, a nursing shield was discovered at the “Five Points” site. This post natal care item would have been used to protect a lactating mother’s clothes from being stained with milk, and used to conceal the fact that she was nursing a baby from her customers (Yamin 2005).

Archaeological evidence has shown consistently that prostitutes raised their children in the brothel. Disconcerting material evidence concludes that infant remains were amongst the debris discovered in the privy. Scholar, Thomas A. Crist expands on the findings at the “Five Points:”

The skeletal remains of two full-term neonates and a fetus were revealed. The well preserved neonatal remains, probably twins, represent either concealment of a stillbirth or neoanticide, a subtype of infanticide. The presence of the “quickenened” fetus in a different privy layer reflects concealment of a miscarriage or an induced abortion (Crist 2005).

The traces of health risk and gynecological concerns (including venereal disease) incorporated in the material record shed concrete consideration of the hazardous conditions involved in the prostitution trade in the nineteenth-century. However, life in the brothel was a safer environment to undergo such tribulations than working alone on the streets. The company of other women, the knowledge and past experience of the madam, and the accessibility of medicinal supplies—at least, provided a network of commonality amongst the women. I would go a step further in arguing that emotional support and unity existed in some houses of prostitution in the nineteenth-century. A true account of a woman in the trade (1871 to 1909) provides a self-reflective narrative into this social framework. Madam Josie Washburn wrote:

The landlady of the underworld is usually misrepresented. She is accused of illtreating the girls in various ways, by “locking them in” and “overcharging,” etc. You will find ignorant and abusive managers in all branches of business, and it isn’t to be supposed that the underworld is an exception. As a rule the landlady is kind to the girls, and if she has been obliged to “lock her in,” it is usually to the advantage of the girl, who has a vagabond designer waiting around the corner for a piece of money, or to go away with her on a drunken spree, which is to land the girl in jail. Professional writers will often attempt to explain the inward working of a public house, but they make a dismal failure of it, to say the least. If a girl has become involved in a frenzied affair over some good-for-nothing dope-fiend, who is obtaining all of her money, in such a case the madam may try to detain her any old way, as the occasion warrants severe measures. It is regarded in the underworld as the proper thing to use these restrictions to break up the combination. Besides, it is always a reflection upon the “reputation” of the landlady and her house for ITS MEMBERS TO BE ARRESTED; THE DISGRACE AND HUMILIATION ARE NOT DIMINISHED BY THE FREQUENT REPETITION. These underworld “crooks” who live upon the girls belong to the lowest grade of humanity, and it the duty of the landlady to protect her girls from them as much as possible. The landlady is the BEST FRIEND THE GIRL HAS, AND IT IS GENERALLY SO ADMITTED by the girl who believes in being anywhere near decent; the girl depends upon the madam’s judgment and will come to her for advice in all of her troubles; in fact, there is a GOOD WILL AND LOVE BETWEEN THEM THAT NOTHING CAN CHANGE (Wood 1997).

Granted, Ms. Washburn's account may be self-serving on some level but the description is valuable.

Los Angeles Red-Light District: a Middle-Class Parlor House (1880-1901)

An archaeological excavation was conducted in downtown Los Angeles in 1996 in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act and its state guidelines. The contract project was investigated by Foothill Resources, Ltd, Applied Earthworks, Inc., and Sonoma State University. The project was in conjunction with the Metropolitan Water District of Southern California for the construction of a new Headquarters Facility (Costello et al. 1998).

The artifact assemblage from the Los Angeles Headquarters Project site uncovered brothel deposits that ranged in date from 1888 through 1901. The features that were uncovered in downtown Los Angeles were comprised of four general deposits 1) "domestic occupation sites" 2) "commercial sites" 3) "domestic architecture" 4) "industrial structures." There were three structures and seventeen deposits found in the excavation process (Costello et al. 1998). Among the features uncovered at the Los Angeles parlor house was Feature Number 426, and was situated at 372 Aliso Street cross street Alameda. The excavation was conducted by Susan Goldberg (project manager), Julia Costello (co-principal investigator) and Adrian Praetzelis (co-principal investigator).

Methodology for ceramic and faunal analysis consisted of systems using the number of identified specimens (NISP) and the minimum number of individuals (MNI).

Some of the statistics were based according to the 1979 Lyman method; due to the high counts of steak bone (Costello et al. 1998). William Marvin Mason, who assisted with analysis and research on the Los Angeles brothel site, described the dishware and types found at 327 Aliso Street “extravagant compared to neighboring working class households (Mason 1999).

Faunal Remains

In contrast to the elaborate dishware, the women who occupied the parlor house at 372 Aliso Street ate foods that were more or less comparable with surrounding working-class households. The faunal remains suggest that the borders ate a range of foods consistent with their income limitations. Among the seven households on the street, the parlor house fell fourth in the “average grouping,” which indicates that the food consumed was not of lesser or greater quality than the rest of the street. The biggest difference between the parlor house household and its next door neighbors was the assortment of meats and fish. The greatest percentage of meat cuts (39%) were moderate-priced and dominated by chuck and rump. High-priced cuts constituted 35% of the assemblage and were evenly divided between leg of mutton and porterhouse steaks. Low-priced cuts accounted for 25% of the collection (Mason 1999). The dominant meat was beef and was slightly more than 65% of the total meat weight represented by the entire large mammal bones recovered. Twenty percent was of mutton, 5% pork, and 5% poultry. Eight percent of the collection recovered from the privy was shellfish and was consistent with surrounding households. However, the variety of fish significantly varied

from the neighboring working-class households. “At least 10 species of fish and 9 species of shellfish are represented in the brothel deposit, compared to an average of 3.5% species of fish and 4.3% species of shellfish in the other residential deposits on Aliso Street” (Costello et al. 1999).

Ceramics

Similar to those found in the “Five Points” district, the ceramics uncovered at the brothel on 327 Aliso Street were of better economic quality than their next door working-class neighbors. Approximately, two-thirds of the dishware uncovered from the privy was of porcelain. The porcelain fragments and multi-piece sets included plates, saucers, cups, and porcelain fruit bowls. These items had scallop-rims with gilded bands as well as patterns with diverse hand-painted fruit designs on the surface (Costello et al. 1999). Another full set of porcelain tableware was recovered intact, and was ornately decorated with floral decal hand-painted accents, and gilding; all of them glazed. It was suggested that the sets would have been used for serving clients hors d’oeuvres and that the women of the house would have used the everyday less expensive pieces for dining (Costello 1999); similar to the analysis of Mary Ann Hall’s parlor house.

The categories that were used to differentiate the brothel and the neighboring homes included four distinct sub-groups: 1) eating and serving 2) tumblers and stemware 3) cups and mugs 4) kitchen and other. The most significant juxtaposition between the brothel and its neighbors was the number of goblets and wine glasses found in the privy; these were indicative of the tumblers and stemware sub-group. Sixty-six percent of the

brothel's ceramic assemblage was dominated by this group (Meyer et al. 2005). Systems analysis calculated that there were less cups and mugs (7%) than neighboring units (13%). Historic glass monopolized the vessel count, and included cut, pressed, etched, hand-blown, and colored items (Meyer et al. 2005). There were also high counts of "tumblers and stemware" (66%), which match the quantity of alcoholic bottles uncovered in the parlor house privy. The "eating and serving" items consisted of 27%, and are analogous with the economic signature that reflected the "food-related" ceramics category. Typologies were predominantly porcelain, improved white wares, and earthenwares. The porcelain count for the brothel was 45% but compared to working-class neighbors the count ranged 12 to 38% (Meyer et al. 2005). The owners of such establishments (the parlor houses) knew how to impress their customers in upscale Victorian styles and the affluence of the house was reflected in the assemblage's makes and motifs (Meyer et al. 2005).

Pharmaceutical and Medical Components

Outward appearances in the Los Angeles parlor house went beyond just ambience and visible economic pretenses. Chief to the 327 Aliso Street board was the large excess of medicinal paraphernalia that was unearthed in the privy.

Table Below: Pharmaceutical Data

Pharmaceutical/Health Diagram

Methodologies differ subsequent to site (BROAD comparisons)

	HYGIENE/ GROOMING	DISEASE	PROPHYLACTICS	MISC/HEALTH
Washington, D.C.	<u>Mary Ann Hall's:</u> Mirror Fragments Hairpins Combs Jewelry	<u>Hooker's Division (Ohio Ave):</u> Soothing syrups Meat juices	<u>Hooker's Division</u> 1 Vaseline Pharmaceutical bottles	<u>Hooker's Division</u> Putnam's White Satin Bouquet perfume Bromo seltzer
New York	5 Perfume bottles 1 Toothbrush 1 Hairbrush, Combs 24 Mirror fragments	<u>100's of medicinal bottles</u>	Syringes Vinegar	1 thermometer 20 pitchers Unusual number of chamber pots
Los Angeles	<u>114 Items</u> 20 perfume bottles 17 cream jars 9 cologne 17 Florida water; type of cologne 14 Jars tooth powders Brushes, combs, razor	<u>89 medicine bottles</u> <u>35 Homeopathic vials</u> <u>27 Pharmaceutical (Costello 2003);</u> "measures used to prevent conception were generally the same used to prevent venereal disease" (Costello 2005)	5 Rubber syringes 1 glass syringe Douche syringe & bulb 9 Prophylactic bottles 12 Vaseline Jars	Morphine/Alcohol Fig Syrup Muriatic Acids Extract of Henbane (Costello 2003) Pitchers, slop jar Chamber pots Washbasins
New Orleans	Jar of French perfume 1 Decanter stopper 1 Soda Water Bottle Cologne bottle Green rouge pots 1 Toothbrush	1 Aquamarine Vial	Medicinal bottles not categorized	Wash Bin

Thirty four percent of the brothel artifacts were related to health and preventative measures concerning gynecological care, physical hygiene, and overall grooming. The items in neighboring households ranged from 12 to 32%. The Los Angeles site had an unusual amount of toothbrushes and tooth cleaning powders (rare for the period), perfumes, hair brushes, chamber pots, medicine bottles, and syringes. The high numbers

of toothbrushes found at 372 Aliso Street are rare among households from this time period, and furthermore, the women would have better dental health (Costello 2003).

Approximately, two-hundred medicinal bottles were uncovered from the privy; this doubled with surrounding working-class neighbors. A common and easy boost of preventative insurance used in the parlor house was called “Darby’s Prophylactic Fluid,” and was manufactured in Philadelphia by J.H. Zeilin and Company. Six ointment syringes were uncovered as well as a breast pump, again, showing evidence of children being raised. Douche formulas and gynecological accoutrements were also detected, which support preemptive safeguards of women’s health.

Personal Items

An array of personal items was uncovered from the 327 Aliso Street brothel. Some of these included cream jars and pots (from NYC, Paris, San Francisco, Ohio, London, and Los Angeles), perfumes (from Philadelphia, Paris, London, NYC), Colognes (from NYC and Massachusetts), tooth cleaning utensils and pastes (one cherry flavored), a razor, comb, soap-dish set, pitcher, slop jar, and a powder-puff handle.

Individual items such as these play a role in representing the importance of grooming and presentation. The women who lived at 327 Aliso Street spent significant time on their looks; after all, their vehicle for success was dependent on such—to look attractive, to smell lovely, and to manipulate an overall experience for the clientele to *feel* special—special enough to return again and to spend more money.

A Los Angeles “Crib” on Easy Jeanette Street (1894-1904)

The concluding archaeological excavations examined in this thesis include two “crib” sites: the 1st) in Storyville, New Orleans and the 2nd) situated in downtown’s Los Angeles Red-Light district, just a few blocks from the parlor house at 372 Aliso Street. The purpose of placing these two sites parallel to one another is to classify the “cribs” in a category of their own, separate from brothels, boards, and parlor houses. As noted earlier, “cribs” were usually just an “office space” to conduct business. The women would sit half inside and half outside their window sill, seated on a pillow like manikins, posing for passers by to stop-in for a moment or a few. The fair was absurdly inexpensive in “cribs,” and the service was usually over within minutes (Costello et al. 1999). The rented space was often designated to one-room with not much more than a bed and a wash sink inside (Costello et al. 1999). Site specialist William Marvin Mason describes “crib” life in downtown Los Angeles in the 1890’s,”

The monthly rent for a crib was about \$75 while the crib fee for sex was one dollar, sometimes more, depending on youth and beauty of the prostitute in question. While the pay was lucrative, there were some major problems with the profession, such as ostracism and scorn from society at large, frequent raids and arrests, exploitation by macs [pimps], and the depressing prospect of having sex with a series of strangers each evening. Opium and liquor were often used to deaden feelings of low self-esteem. Suicide was occasional, most frequently by using laudanum or even poison for vermin. Work in the higher-class bordellos of the city was somewhat better, but even here cases of suicide or insanity were not unheard of. Client paid more, but the house took a customary half of the individual prostitute’s earnings. Bordellos ranged from the ornate to the ramshackle, but in general were better than the cribs. Women who were crib occupants were occasionally murdered or beaten by customers (Costello et al. 1999).

The Los Angeles “crib” site corresponds with Privy 431 and “may have been associated with the cribs on Easy Jeanette Street” (Meyer et al. 2005). The exact location was difficult to confirm because “the cribs shown on the 1899 photograph extend to the middle of the block and the privy structure is blocked from view by other buildings” (Meyer et al. 2005). Easy Jeneatte Street (an infamous row of cribs) was deserted in the year 1904, and the date of the privy was estimated to have been built in 1894 to conjoin with next door “cribs” on the block. The bathrooms were filled-in when the “cribs” got torn down (Meyer et al. 2005). Items uncovered at the site that most likely related to the “crib” included an intact bed, a washbasin, and some miscellaneous glass containers thought to be liquor bottles. The residual content of the privy was a palm tree stump and some Chinese artifacts reflecting the retail influence of neighboring Chinatown vendors (Meyer et al. 2005). The artifact contents found in the privy was sparse indicative of the intention and use of a “crib” quarters.

A Storyville New Orleans “Crib” on Bienville Street (1898-1917)

Contrary to Los Angeles “crib” site—material data from the New Orleans Storyville “crib”—suggests that it had live-in inhabitants. The artifacts found at the site were diverse and more or less representative of a “crib.” The Housing Authority of New Orleans (HANO), the current proprietors of the housing project at the site location, stopped the excavation when they received word that human remains might be present in the debris. Once archaeologists were able to investigate the area they discovered quickly that there was no evidence of human remains. There was however a sizeable sample of

historical artifacts unearthed—and significant amounts of ceramics—and, the Earth Search contract archaeology team decided that a site intervention would be necessary to rescue the remaining artifacts from being destroyed. Ryan Gray of Earth Search relayed that the Iberville Housing Project “were not in ideal conditions. A trench had already been excavated by a construction company at the time the archaeologists were called to the site, so the investigations consisted of documentation and salvage. Only a small proportion dated to the Storyville period” (Ryan Gray, personal communication 2008).

Faunal Remains

The data that I received through correspondence with Ryan Gray (Laboratory Supervisor of Earth Search) did not include data collections of faunal remains. However, in an interview with Archaeology Magazine, Dr. Jill-Karen Yakubic (President and Founder of Earth Search) comments, “we did find animal bones [and] they were cuts of meat you would buy at the local butcher.” Ryan Gray was gracious enough to forward spreadsheets containing the raw data from the investigation. The collections were primarily ceramic typologies as well as other artifacts from the “crib” site.

Ceramics

Several intact ceramics and fragments were recovered from the “crib” site on Bienville Street in New Orleans’ Storyville district. The assemblage consisted of 205 ironstone types, 5 porcelain pieces, 89 fragments of whiteware, and 14 fragments of

stoneware, 5 yellowware sherds, 3 redware, 3 brownware, and 1 rockinghamware item. The significance to the high amounts of ironstone and identification of several pieces of porcelain signify high-end tableware being used and served at this “crib” location. A total of 102 tea pots were also recovered, indicating that the women provided teas and coffee to their clients. The ironstone assemblage included polychrome hand-painted designs, decal, flow blue, annular, and bead molded decorations. The whiteware types showed polychrome hand-painted designs, mochwares, and blue shell-edged types, embossed, trail-slipped annular and plain annular ware as well as blue, green, and black transfer-print. The variety of color, design, illustrations, and typologies, all depict a higher economic range of ceramics found at this location. And, though, the assemblage is rather small compared to other sites; the diversity and high amounts of ironstone is what is most interesting.

Many bottles, glasses, and containers, were collected at the Bienville “crib” site, including a medicine vial, aquamarine vials, mold-impressed forms with vertical ribbing, and a colorless bottle body fragment with embossed quatrefoil marks within concentric circles. A wash basin was also recovered.

Personal Items

A significant number of beauty and grooming supplies were found at the Storyville “crib” site. These artifacts display the attention that the women placed on appearance. The items consisted of a jar of French perfume, 1 decanter stopper, 1 soda water bottle, a cologne bottle, green rouge pots, and 1 toothbrush. Accompanied with the personal items at the “crib” was evidence of children in the brothel. Unique of this site

were the amounts of toys found at this location. Some of them included a ceramic marble, a bisque doll head, a toy carriage wheel, a child tea cup, a child's plate, and dominos.

Documentary accounts relayed by Al Rose give a first-hand account of life in the “cribs.” Rose interviewed a woman named Carrie (no surname) in his book, Storyville New Orleans. Carrie was approximately sixty-eight years old at the time of the interview. Her story is quite tragic and the details that she includes are quite troubling. Carrie admits to being sexually assaulted, ridiculed, and sexually humiliated on a public street. I will not go into details in this paper to what Carrie's personal experiences were, but I will let her describe in her own words some of the ‘ins and outs’ of the “crib” trade. At the time of the interview (1974) Carrie was illiterate. She was raised in a poor neighborhood of New Orleans near Perdido Street uptown, on Canal Street:

In dem days all on Rob'ts'n Street was watcha call cribs, see! Oh, you *knows* whut dey is. Well I had me one a *dem*. When I staht out in d' beginnin' I paid twenny cents a day rent. Latuh on it go up to thutty-fi' cent, and den t' fifty cent. I stayed deah on Rob'ts'n Street fo' yeahs an' yeahs . . . an' den d'law run us out. You unnastan' we wuzn' doin' nothin' agains' d'law, you know. [and]... Well, I use' t' get whutever I could. But mos'ly d' prices wuz d' same on d' street. Depen' was it a weekday or a Sat'dy or Sundy or a holiday—daytime, nighttime, you know. . . [and]... on a weekday night, I use' t' get twenny-fi' cent. Ten cents in d' daytime [and]... good weeks I could take fo'ty dolluh. Big money dem days. All dem prices was double fo' Sat'dy and Sundy—and' they wuzn't no limit come Cawnival time (Rose 1974 pp. 158).

In a later discussion with Carrie, Al Rose learned that “in the course of her bawdy career “Carrie” had given birth to nine children, six girls and three boys, all of whom lived at least to maturity. One of the boys was killed in World War II. The rest are alive at this writing (Rose 1974). Many other women similar to Carrie raised their children in the prostitution trade. The toys and porcelain ceramic artifacts at the Bienville site as well as other brothel sites show evidence for this.

Children in the Brothel

Methodologies differ subsequent to site (BROAD comparisons)

	NURSING	TOYS	INFANT	NOTES
Washington D.C.	<u>Mary Ann Hall's N/A</u>	<u>"Hooker's Division"</u> (Ohio Ave. D.C.) Toys uncovered		
New York	Nursing Shield	Marbles 1 Child Cup 1 Child Tea Set	3 Infant Fetus (Stillbirth OR considered a type of Infanticide)	2 preserved twin fetus 2 bones from a single fetus
Los Angeles	Breast Pump			
New Orleans		Ceramic Marble Bisque Doll Head Toy Carriage Wheel Child Tea Cup Child Plate Dice		
St. Paul, MN		Marbles Figurines Dolls		Brothel down the block Reported 1 child in the census

ANALYSIS

The goal of this analysis is to discuss the correlations and patterns in artifacts as well as broad social themes of the nineteenth-century. Victorian England culture and appearance played a significant role in the brothel sites that I have discussed in this paper. Certainly, there were brothels that did not subscribe to this motif, and focused on other themes, such as specialty acts centering on ethnicity (coined as exotic houses) or focusing on physically degrading exploitation acts involving sex and body distortion entertainment and spectacle acts. These sex work venues, by all means, may not have contributed to the appearance of Victorian social customs in the prostitution trade. However, a fair amount did and ambience in the Victorian parlor house gave the appearance of a more dignified establishment.

Timothy Gilfoyle illustrates the nineteenth-century parlor house,

The term “parlor house” reflected an emphasis on replicating the domestic atmosphere, privacy, and physical environment of the middle-class home. Such houses represented a widening chasm based on gender and class between affluent madams and less successful male workers (Gilfoyle 1992).

American Historian, John Sharpless (University of Wisconsin, Madison) verbally states that in “Victorian England, a night away from work and home for a gentleman would constitute indulging in decadent pleasures such as expensive champagnes and liquor, a first-class dinner, gambling and card-playing, piano music, high-spirited behavior, and last, a woman of your choosing” (John Sharpless, personal communication 2008).

Many madams required that her “girls” be tidy, clean, and presentable. A madam often enforced that her house be above par in cleanliness, her girls be above par in

hygiene, and respectable and congenial in their conduct with the clientele. Documentary texts even refer to some madams home-schooling their girls in current events so that they could hold conversational discussions on topics such as Shakespeare and popular nineteenth-century literature; with business men, politicians, bankers, lawyers, and other various men of well-bread class and background.

Numerous brothels and boarding houses existed in working-class neighborhoods. These establishments clung tight to presenting a veneer of the middle-class. The material artifacts uncovered at 372 Aliso Street in Los Angeles, Orange Street in the “Five Points,” and Mary Ann Hall’s place in Washington, D.C., all represented the material guise of fine economic taste even if they were not high-end or middle-class brothels; such provisions were often premeditative business tactics on behalf of the madam.

Scholar Diana Di Zerega Wall examined similar issues in a non-brothel gender-related research project on middle and working-class women in mid nineteenth-century New York. The analysis of the study focuses on the economic range of ceramics uncovered at two household sites in Greenwich Village 1) 50 Washington Square South and 2) 25 Barrow Street. Wall describes the 50 Washington Square household (a three and half brick story home) as among the wealthy middle-class. The residence showed to have steady live-in domestic help (many of the parlor houses also hired servants) and a carriage and coachmen for a portion of the time they occupied the site. The second household was 25 Barrow Street in Greenwich Village. Wall considered this residence to have been on the lower end of the middle-class scale, and states that the “families apparently belonged near the bottom of the middle class as they rented, rather than owned, their homes, which were apartments, not houses” (Wall 1991).

The material record suggests that three quarters of the Washington Square household ceramics were made up of porcelain and ironstone (50%) with molded motifs, and had decorated gilt floral bands, painted whiteware, white granite ironstone, and transfer-printed cups and saucers (Wall 1991). The ceramics in both assemblages contrasted in economic value but were similar in social meaning and representation. Wall argues,

The similarity of the ceramics suggests that the meals where the ceramics were used had the same social meaning for the relatively wealthy Robsons as for the poorer Barrow Street Family. These dishes were made up at Britain's Staffordshire potteries. These women were rejecting for the most part both the cheaper edged, plain, and sponged dishes as well as the more expensive printed and flawn plates that Americans were also imprinting from these potteries at the time (Wall 1991).

When referring to the Gothic design of the 1840's, Wall states:

It was used predominantly in church design [and like Gothic furniture] it was considered appropriate for dining rooms at this time. The presence of both furniture and vessels of Gothic style could only have enhanced the sacred aspect of women's domestic role within the ritual of family meals (Wall 1991).

The threads of Victorian social climate and structure in American society during the mid 1800's have been studied by several scholars. Archaeological scholar Stephen Brighton (ceramic analyst for the "Five Points" site) examined how important it was to display physical representations of Victorian themes in one's home. In analyzing artifact assemblages at the "Five Points," particularly the courthouse block of Pearl Street (a non-brothel), he posited that the public display of table and tea-wares in the home was a reflection of social values and moral principles. Brighton also discussed themes of "naturalism" and "gothic" illustrations on the ceramics, and how the art and picture illustrations marked religious and nature-theme components parallel to social and

religious nuances of the time (Brighton 2001). He notes, “Despite impoverished conditions, the Pearl Street households were apparently interested in creating respectable table settings” (Brighton 2001).

It was likely that the brothel households held themselves to similar if not higher cultural standards to overcompensate for societal pressures. The female residents in the boarding households were required to face notions of socio-political “respectability” on a daily basis. Reputation and appearance seem to have been crucial in upholding certain pretenses as well as ones dignity. Brighton concludes that “The Victorian cultural standards infiltrated through the majority of the social infrastructure, not just the aristocrats of high society but the middle and working-class families.” The artifact assemblage of ceramics portrayed this theme even in the “impoverished” “Five Points” district. Brighton referred to the work of Praetzellis and Praetzellis (1992) which agrees to the fact that “Victorians stressed symmetry in the display and use of ceramics in the public arena. Matching patterns were the ideal when accessible” (Brighton 2001).

The brothel on Orange Street in the “Five Points” was in a very profitable position, and in a location for all classes to partake. It was situated just a few blocks from City Hall, a half a mile from the business district and half a block away from the Bowery; able to cater to both sailors and industrial workers off the port (Milne and Crabtree 2001). Similarly, Mary Ann Hall’s parlor house (though in a more upscale neighborhood than the “Five Points”) was located in walking distance to the nation’s capitol (O’Brien 2005). Tax reports showed that the Hall’s block was in the *Southwest Quadrant* near the water canal. The locale of the house was likely a conscious business move on Madam Hall’s, who must have known travelers passed by on their way to government meetings (O’Brien

2005). The Los Angeles parlor house was located in the city's most bustling neighborhood, and was on the main railroad line. In fact, the Alameda Street's Red-Light district encompassed the areas between Aliso and Los Angeles Streets (including "cribs" at Ord, New High, and Buena Vista Streets). Prostitution had entrenched itself in this area of downtown by the late 1880's, and it continued steadily from the construction of "cribs" into the early 1890's. The Alameda district was divided between the many rows of "cribs," brothels, and saloons (Mason 1999).

The appearance of the Victorian theme demonstrated in high-class parlor houses could have derived from a need to overcompensate for the lack of social respect and hostility the women faced in mainstream society. Both madams and prostitutes were potentially entangled in sizeable social webs of notoriety—and, perhaps in order to maintain economic survival, a few madams learned quickly to create an environment that reflected a high-class Victorian theme. Selling sex in the nineteenth-century was and has always been a commodity. Houses of decadence have survived through vast and distant time. Woman from all classes of society turned to the trade for a multitude of reasons; financial struggle, desperate measures, abandoned from kin or perhaps with child or orphaned. One analysis rests on the notion that the Victorian Era was rich with harsh social etiquettes and pressures and that the period was rigorous in its hierarchal social nature, correct ideological norms, and social expectations (especially for women). For one to justifiably stray from these "norms" and "traditions and "customs," it would have often led to out cast. Males as well as females were expected to uphold certain roles and so did women. If deviation of these roles occurred both genders faced repercussions; but often the demise of a woman's reputation was all the more catastrophic and tainting in

social positions, and generally, resulted in expulsion. A workforce salary did not always grant the ability to pay outside expenses. The majority of the women who were cast out from prior more “respectable” positions in society learned, once involved in the trade, that social isolation was a part of the lifestyle. But brothel life was a *form* of “rescue” from this isolation, and provided at the very least, commonality. The “underworld” lifestyle was more lucrative than a job of a seamstress, launderer, house maid, department store clerk, etc., and often a woman would get accustomed to higher earnings in a “board.” It’s also important to note that many prostitutes entered the trade with intentions to leave, after putting aside savings; but the life was more often than not a dead end and many of the prostitutes of the nineteenth-century committed suicide or departed from severe cases of venereal disease.

Results and Conclusions

My thesis discussion and theoretical arguments consciously tried to avoid a clichéd generalization of “brothel environments.” The uniqueness of any home or business setting is subject to the person who runs it, and in the case of most brothels (as opposed to “cribs”), the establishment was both business and home for the occupants. For instance, when comparing brothel sites in Washington, D.C., Donna Seifert said, “The collections from the brothels of three periods exhibit distinctly different patterns, which indicated that the household function alone does not account for artifact pattern” (Seifert and Balicki 2005). Seifert argues, “There is no simple brothel pattern [or] no clear artifact signature that reveals a brothel in the archaeological record” (Seifert and Balicki 2005).

The brothels being compared in this thesis differ significantly from one to the next in variables such as distinct artifact assemblage, class structure, and regional locale, legal policies surrounding the trade, socio-political aspects, and the madams' individual preference of internal business policy; yet as mentioned, I would argue that there are broad universal trends to these sites as well.

Recent historical archaeological analysis of North American brothel sites conducted by contract archaeologists have focused on locations in Los Angeles, New York, Washington, D.C., and New Orleans, for both preservation and urban planning reasons. The data for this thesis were comprised from books, journals, articles, site reports, publications, and direct correspondence with contract archaeologists. The focus placed on these four archaeological sites, in particular, was to analyze some of the substantial broad universal trends in brothels across North America as well as discuss the underlying differences. Spotlights on faunal remains, ceramics, personal items (such as perfumes, colognes, creams, toothbrushes, brushes), and gynecological preemptive remedies (breast pumps, female bed pans, syringes, etc.) were for cross-comparing purposes and depict patterns in class, hygiene, and awareness of health, disease, and contraception.

The sites share common characteristics of meat type as well as unique differences. New York's Five Points (a low-end brothel) show that inexpensive cuts of meat made up the largest portion but that figures were parallel with nearby residences such as the Irish Tenement. The Washington, D.C. site (a high-end brothel) exhibited meat cuts that were significantly different from surrounding neighbors; and were medium to high in price. The Los Angeles site (a moderate-end brothel) show cuts that ranged in comparison with working-class neighbors but provides a wide range in the sources of fish and shell fish—

which differ from nearby households. Lastly, the New Orleans site represented “cuts of meat you would buy at the local butcher” (Yakubic 2002).

Beef made up the highest percentage of meat at Mary Ann Hall’s site in Washington, D.C. (47%) as well as the Los Angeles site (65%), where pork had higher percentages at Mary Ann Hall’s (37%) than figures at the Los Angeles site (5%). Mutton (sheep) consumption is also a widespread similarity between the brothel sites, and exhibited parallel percentages between Mary Ann Hall’s (21%) and 372 Aliso Street in Los Angeles (20%). Meats including beef, pork, and mutton, make up the highest percentages at New York’s “Five Points” brothel; the individual percentage to each number was all inclusive in a total of 50% however so it is hard to distinguish detailed amounts of consumption within the three meat categories.

While there are some generalities in meat consumption there are also some major differences among the sites. Mary Ann Hall’s site was unique in so far as turtle, hen, and various fruits and vegetables. There are no signs of such foods at the other sites. What make New York’s “Five Points” stand out are the presence of duck, goose, pigeon, turkey, dog, cat, rabbit, and squirrel, and fish (4%). The Los Angeles sites, unlike the other sites, have very high amounts of fish and shellfish. The varieties include: salmon, cod, mackerel, halibut, sheepshead, barracuda, whitefish, sandbass, and yellowtail. The shell fish remains uncovered entail Atlantic oyster, Eastern oyster, Pacific oyster, Black abalone, Green abalone, Pacific scallop, pismo clam, thatched barnacle, and California venew. New Orleans faunal analysis was not available for this paper.

Ceramic Analysis

Significant of the patterns of ceramics at each of the sites show little pattern. Mary Ann Hall's site has high counts of porcelain and ironstone. New York's "Five Points" show matching sets that Dr. Yamin notes, "The complete Chinese porcelain tea set while not unique is as elegant as the porcelains recovered on sites associated with upper-class New Yorkers (Yamin 2005). One might think that Mary Ann Hall's board would have had matching sets on account of the economic standing she kept ?—but, this is not the case. The Los Angeles site indicates matching sets, however and display low percentages of ceramics compared to alcohol content—hence, serving drinks seem to have taken priority over serving food to the clientele (Costello et al. 1999). Lastly, New Orleans illustrate no matching sets that I can make out still, there are high counts of ironstone and porcelain. The two sites that we don't find matching sets have higher amounts of porcelain and ironstone which may simply mark more effort was placed on expensive ceramics than sets; again, a madam or resident's personal choice.

Health and Grooming Trends

All the sites excluding Mary Ann Hall's (where methodologies mixed medicinal vessels and kitchen wares) have significant trends in health and grooming artifacts. The three trends are 1) gynecological health care regarding venereal disease prophylactics 2) grooming items such as perfumes, brushes, toothbrushes, tooth powders, make-up, and mirror fragments, and 3) health care regarding contraception prophylactics.

To make-up for inconclusive data at Mary Ann Hall's parlor house, inclusive of Dr. Seifert's past studies on brothels site in Washington, D.C.'s Hooker Division—is a site on Ohio Avenue that shows a Vaseline bottle, various pharmaceutical bottles, soothing syrups, and meat juices (known to cure diseases) (Seifert 1991). New York's "Five Points" exhibits syringes, vinegar, 100's of medicinal bottles, a thermometer, 20 pitchers, and an unusual amount of chamber pots as well as high numbers of grooming supplies. Compared with the other sites, the Los Angeles brothel has the largest assemblage of medicinal items. New Orleans artifacts were hard to examine but the items affiliated with health and grooming includes: a wash bin, French perfume, soda water, cologne, green rouge, and a toothbrush. The fact that assortments of these items were found at all the sites exemplifies that cleanliness, grooming, and health, was a priority in these brothels.

Finally, I thought it was important to address the artifacts that pertained to children being raised in the brothel. The presence of a breast pump in Los Angeles, a nursing shield in New York, toys found at the Ohio Avenue site in Hooker's division, toys found in the backyard of a brothel in Saint Paul, Minnesota (Ketz et al. 2005), and toys found both at the New Orleans "crib" site and the New York site—all suggests that children did, in fact, grow up in the trade; brothels and Storyville "cribs" alike. Although, the thought is disconcerting in nature, it shows that *some* of these women did not decide to necessarily give-up or consciously aboard their children because of the sex work profession. These in depth studies of prostitution in the historical period can shed significant understanding as to how these women lived in parlor houses, brothels, and "cribs." Not only can we learn more about what they ate, their economic class, and the

ceramics they ate and served from—but how they tried to circumvent health ailments and counteract conception and venereal disease in these settings. Contract archaeology has allowed for further understanding into gender and sexuality-related issues surrounding women in the nineteenth and early twentieth-centuries. The research carried out by historical archaeologists and historians alike can fill in some of the missing gaps as to how these women lived, worked, and managed in the prostitution trade in the dawn of industrial America. Archaeological research and analysis of the material record further addresses some of these questions, and provides evidence in a tangible and concrete way to help reconstruct the lives of these women so that their triumphs, obstacles, and efforts can be documented for years to come.

References Cited

Brighton, Stephen A.

- 2001 Prices That Suit the Times: Shopping For Ceramics at the Five Points. *Historical Archaeology* 35(3):16-30.

Costello, Julia G.

- 2003 Behind the Red Lights: Prostitution in Los Angeles, 1880-1910. *Restoring Women's Preservation* by Gail Dubrow and Jennifer Goodman (Editors), pp. 177-196. Johns Hopkins University Press, Baltimore, MD.

Costello, Julia G. (Editor) and contributions by Costello, Adrian Praetzellis, Mary Praetzellis, Erica S. Gibson, Judith Marvin, Michael D. Meyer, Grace H. Ziesing, Sherri M. Gust, Madeleine Hirn, William Marvin Mason, Elaine-Maryse Solari, Suzanne B. Stewart, William Marvin Mason

- 1999 Historical Archaeology at the Headquarters Facility Project Site, The Metropolitan Water District of Southern California. Volume 2 Interpretive Report. Report to Union Station Partners, Altadena, CA, on behalf of The Metropolitan Water District of Southern California, Los Angeles, CA, from Foothill Recourses, Ltd., Mokelumne Hill, CA; Applied Earthworks, Inc., Fresno, CA; and the Anthropological Studies Center, Sonoma State University, Rohnert Park, CA (communications with Julia G. Costello).

Costello, Julia G., Adrian Praetzellis, Mary Praetzellis, Judith Marvin, Michael D. Meyer, Erica S. Gibson, Grace H. Ziesing

- 1998 Historical Archaeology at the Headquarters Facility Project Site, The Metropolitan Water District of Southern California. Volume 1 Data Report. Recovered Data, Stratigraphy, Artifacts, and Documents. Report to Union Station Partners, Altadena, CA, on behalf of The Metropolitan Water District of Southern California, Los Angeles, CA, from Foothill Recourses, Ltd., Mokelumne Hill, CA; Applied Earthworks, Inc., Fresno, CA; and the Anthropological Studies Center, Sonoma State University, Rohnert Park, CA (communications with Julia G. Costello).

Crist, Thomas A.

- 2005 Babies in the Privy: Prostitution, Infanticide, and Abortion in New York City's Five Points District. *Historical Archaeology* 39(1):19-46.

Sharpless, Megan

- 2008 Data Tables (citations are included in the PowerPoint following *Acknowledgements*).

Enss, Chris

- 2006 *Pistol Packin' Madams; True Stories of Notorious Women of the West*. The Globe Pequot Press, Guilford, Connecticut.

- Gilfoyle, Timothy J.
 2005 Archaeologists in the Brothel: "Sin City," Historical Archaeology and Prostitution. *Historical Archaeology* 39(1):133-141.
- Gilfoyle, Timothy J.
 1999 Prostitutes in History: From Parables of Pornography to Metaphors of Modernity. *The American Historical Review* 104(1):117-141.
- Gilfoyle, Timothy J.
 1992 *City of Eros: New York City, Prostitution, and the Commercialization of Sex, 1790-1920*. W.W. Norton, New York, NY.
- Gray, Ryan
 2008 Correspondence with Ryan Gray regarding the Storyville New Orleans "Iberville Site." Artifact context and Data Spreadsheets from Bienville Street "Crib" Residence: Feature 1 (Levels 1, 2, 3) and SED "Upper Black Midden" (South of F-5, North of and over F-5 Pier, Southeast corner of D) (communications with Ryan Gray).
- Ketz, K. Anne, Elizabeth J. Abel, and Andrew J. Schmidt
 1992 Public Image and Private Reality: An Analysis of Differentiation in a Nineteenth-Century St. Paul Bordello. *Historical Archaeology* 39(1): 74-88.
- Meyer, Michael D., Erica S. Gibson, and Julia G. Costello
 2005 City of Angels, City of Sin: Archaeology in the Los Angeles Re-Light District ca. 1900. *Historical Archaeology* 39(1):107-125.
- Milne, C. and Pamela J. Crabtree
 2000 Prostitutes, a Rabbi, and a Carpenter-Dinner at the Five Points in the 1830s. *Historical Archaeology* 35(3):31-48.
- O'Brien, Elizabeth Barthold
 2005 Illicit Congress in the Nation's Capital: The History of Mary Ann Hall's Brothel. *Historical Archaeology* 39(1):47-58.
- Powell, Eric A.
 2001 Tales From Storyville: Digging the "Sporting Life" in Old New Orleans. *Archaeology Magazine* 55(6): 26-31.
- Rose, Al
 1974 *Storyville, New Orleans, Being an Authentic, Illustrated Account of the Notorious Red-Light District*, The University of Alabama Press.
- Seifert, Donna J., Elizabeth Barthold O'Brien, and Joseph Balicki

1999 Mary Ann Hall's first-class house: the archaeology of a capital brothel. *Archaeologies of Sexuality*, Robert A. Schmidt and Barbara L. Voss editors, pp. 117-127.

Seifert, Donna J. and Joseph Balicki

2004 Mary Ann Hall's House. *Historical Archaeology* 39(1):59-73.

Seifert, Donna J. (Edited)

1991 Within Site of the White House: The Archaeology of Working Women. *Historical Archaeology* 25(4):82-108.

Sharpless, Megan

1993 PowerPoint Slides, produced for Senior Thesis Presentation to present to University of Wisconsin – La Crosse Archaeology Faculty.

Spude, Catherine Holder

2005 Brothels and Saloons: An Archaeology of Gender in the American West. *Historical Archaeology* 39(1): 89-106.

Yamin, Rebecca

2005 Wealthy, Free, and Female: Prostitution in Nineteenth-Century New York. *Historical Archaeology* 39(1): 4-18.

Yamin, Rebecca

1997 New York's Mythic Slum; Digging Lower Manhattan's Infamous Five Points. *Archaeology Magazine* 50(2): 44-53.

Wall, Diana diZerega

1991 Sacred Dinners and Secular Teas: Constructing Domesticity in Mid-19th-Century New York. *Historical Archaeology* 25(4):69-81.

Wood, Sharon E. (Introduction)

1997 *The Underworld Sewer: A Prostitute Reflects on Life in the Trade, 1871-1909. Jodie Washburn*. The University of Nebraska Press. Reprinted from the original 1909 edition by the Washburn Publishing Company, Omaha, Nebraska.

The American Heritage® Dictionary of the English Language, Fourth Edition

Copyright © 2006 by Houghton Mifflin Company. Published by Houghton Mifflin Company. All rights reserved.

Demimonde

- a. A class of women kept by wealthy lovers or protectors.
- b. Women prostitutes considered as a group.
2. A group whose respectability is dubious or whose success is marginal: *the literary demimonde of ghost writers, hacks, and publicists*. Also called *demiworld*.

Acknowledgements

To my Readers (University of Wisconsin – La Crosse Archaeology Faculty):

Dr. James Theler

Dr. Joseph Tiffany

Dr. Mark Chavalas

Dr. Timothy McAndrews

Correspondences with Professional Historical Archaeologists:

Dr. Glenn Farris, California Department of Parks & Recreation, Sacramento, CA

Dr. Julia G. Costello, Foothill Resources, Ltd., Mokelumne Hill, CA

Ryan Gray, Laboratory Supervisor, Earth Search Inc., New Orleans, LA

Dr. Judy Tordoff, CALTRANS (recently retired), Sacramento, CA